



GOVERNMENT OPERATIONS, RULES & CLAIMS COMMITTEE

COMMITTEE MEETING

~ MINUTES ~

Tuesday, November 22, 2022

3:00 PM

Sullivan Chamber
795 Massachusetts Avenue
Cambridge, MA 02139

The Government Operations, Rules & Claims Committee will conduct a public meeting to discuss the City Manager's Annual Evaluation process.

Attendee Name	Present	Absent	Late	Arrived
Alanna Mallon	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	
Dennis J. Carlone	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	
Patricia Nolan	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	
E. Denise Simmons	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	
Paul F. Toner	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	

A meeting of the Government Operations, Rules and Claims Committee was held on Tuesday, November 22, 2022. The meeting was called to order at 3:00 p.m. by the Honorable Vice Mayor Mallon, Chair of the Committee. Pursuant to Chapter 20 of the Acts of 2022 adopted by Massachusetts General Assembly and approved by the Governor, this public meeting was hybrid, allowing participation in person, in the Sullivan Chamber, 2nd Floor, City Hall, 795 Massachusetts Avenue, Cambridge, MA and by remote participation via zoom.

The Chair, Vice Mayor Mallon called the meeting to order and noted that the call of the meeting was to discuss the City Manager's Annual evaluation process.

The Chair, Vice Mayor Mallon asked the Clerk to call the roll.

City Clerk LeBlanc called the roll.

Councillor Dennis J. Carlone – Present/Remote

Councillor Patricia Nolan – Present/In Sullivan Chamber

Councillor E. Denise Simmons – Absent

Councillor Paul Toner – Present/In Sullivan Chamber

Vice Mayor Alanna M. Mallon – Present/In Sullivan Chamber

Present-4, Absent-1. Quorum established.

The Chair, Vice Mayor Mallon recognized and welcomed Mayor Siddiqui, City Manager Yi-An Huang, and Personnel Director Sheila Keady Rawson. The Chair, Vice Mayor Mallon noted that the City Manager's contract calls for an annual performance review and that the process and timing of evaluations would be agreed upon within 90 days of the City Manager's start date. The Chair noted that by December 5, 2022, the City Council needs to vote on a framework for the annual performance evaluation. The Chair, Vice Mayor Mallon further noted that she, Councillor Toner, and City Manager Huang worked on a draft framework that was shared as part of the agenda packet in advance of this meeting. The Chair, Vice Mayor Mallon shared the document titled "City Manager Annual Performance Evaluation Process" on screen (copy

attached) and reviewed the document in detail noting the timeline, how shared goals will be established, use of a 360-review process and the role of a City Manager Performance Ad Hoc Committee.

The Chair, Vice Mayor Mallon recognized Councillor Toner who spoke to his experience with various organizations including the Mass Teachers Association, The Board of Higher Education, and Blue Cross of Massachusetts, noting that the process being put forth was similar in that it provides for setting goals, a mid-year check in and 360 feedback.

The Chair, Vice Mayor Mallon recognized City Manager Huang who thanked the Vice Mayor and Councillor Toner for their work. City Manager Huang noted that he was excited about and supportive of this process. The City Manager noted that the goal setting process that happens at the beginning of the year is really important and having a performance framework overall for what it means to do well in this role. City Manager Huang noted that this is an important role and ultimately there needs to be a more transparent and accountable progress on how things are being done and how decisions are being made. The City Manager noted further that the conversation is important to build trust in government and that it is important for him as the City Manager to begin modeling what a performance review process might look like.

The Chair, Vice Mayor Mallon recognized Councillor Nolan for comments and questions. Councillor Nolan stated her position that the document should say performance review rather than performance evaluation because this is what was called for in the ballot question that was passed with overwhelming support. Councillor Nolan recommended taking out 360 reviews because reviews from direct reports are not 360 reviews and raised the question of adding community partners.

The Chair, Vice Mayor Mallon recognized Councillor Carlone for comments and questions. Councillor Carlone thanked the City Manager for recognizing how important this process is. Councillor Carlone asked about the process of the 360 reviews and getting feedback from those who work directly for the City Manager. The Chair, Vice Mayor Mallon noted the Chair of the Ad Hoc Committee would be putting a consolidated review together that would be presented to the City Manager and recognized Councillor Toner to also respond. Councillor Toner noted he has seen feedback from direct reports handled different ways with the intent of keeping feedback anonymous. Councillor Carlone asked if the Ad Hoc Committee would be preparing the 10 questions being asked. The Chair, Vice Mayor Mallon stated that the vision was for the Ad Hoc Committee to work with the Personnel Department and the Chief People Officer to develop the question. Councillor Carlone asked who would be privy to the information collected. The Chair, Vice Mayor Mallon responded that the process would not violate the open meeting law and that the consolidated report would be presented in public. The Chair, Vice Mayor Mallon recognized City Solicitor Nancy Glowa to respond further. Solicitor Glowa noted that the Council should not expect to go into executive session with respect to this kind of process and that the Ad Hoc Committee would need to notice their meetings in accordance with the Open Meeting Law. Solicitor Glowa noted that less than a quorum of the Ad Hoc Committee would likely meet with the Chief People Officer or Personnel Director to go over anything that might need to be redacted and to ensure that the information is being appropriately communicated. The Chair, Vice Mayor Mallon recognized Mayor Siddiqui who noted that because of the Open Meeting Law, the School Committee has never gone into Executive Session related to the review of the Superintendent.

The Chair, Vice Mayor Mallon, noted she was moving to a second document titled "City Manager Performance Review Template-Performance Categories" that was provided in advance

as part of the agenda packet (copy attached). The Chair, Vice Mayor Mallon showed the document on the screen and noted that this was a draft of what 10 performance goals would look like. The Chair, Vice Mayor Mallon noted that the goals were pulled from the leadership profile that was used during the City Manager search and they would be used loosely in connection with the 90-day review of the City Manager. The Chair, Vice Mayor Mallon described four-point scale and noted that the Council ultimately needs to decide on the goals and the rating scale. The Chair, Vice Mayor Mallon recognized Councillor Toner, Councillor Nolan, and Councillor Carlone for comments on the rating scale and process going forward. The Chair, Vice Mayor Mallon noted that a specific meeting called by the Mayor, perhaps a roundtable, to define shared goals would be in order. The Chair, Vice Mayor Mallon recognized Solicitor Glowa who noted that the Council could consider contracting with a third party to administer the surveys, review the responses, anonymize them appropriately and then send them on to the Ad Hoc Committee. The Chair, Vice Mayor Mallon noted that she would go back and refine both documents and put them forth on the agenda for December 5, 2022. The Chair, Vice Mayor Mallon recognized City Manager Huang who commented that for his 90 day report he will be organizing around the areas laid out in the draft template noting what has been accomplished and making observations on opportunities and challenges withing these areas.

The Chair, Vice Mayor Mallon recognized Councillor Nolan who made a motion to authorize Vice Mayor Mallon to amend both documents presented per the discussion at this meeting and bring them forth to the Full City Council for review and potential adoption on December 5, 2022.

City Clerk LeBlanc called the Roll.

Councillor Dennis J. Carlone – Yes
Councillor Patricia Nolan – Yes
Councillor E. Denise Simmons – Absent
Councillor Paul Toner – Yes
Vice Mayor Alanna M. Mallon – Yes
Yes-4, No-0, Absent-1. Motion passed.

The Chair, Vice Mayor Mallon recognized Councillor Nolan who made a motion to close public comment.

City Clerk LeBlanc called the Roll.

Councillor Dennis J. Carlone – Yes
Councillor Patricia Nolan – Yes
Councillor E. Denise Simmons – Absent
Councillor Paul Toner – Yes
Vice Mayor Alanna M. Mallon – Yes
Yes-4, No-0, Absent-1. Motion passed.

The Chair, Vice Mayor Mallon recognized Councillor Toner who made a motion to adjourn.

City Clerk LeBlanc called the Roll.

Councillor Dennis J. Carlone – Yes
Councillor Patricia Nolan – Yes
Councillor E. Denise Simmons – Absent

Councillor Paul Toner – Yes

Vice Mayor Alanna M. Mallon – Yes

Yes-4, No-0, Absent-1. Motion passed.

The Chair, Vice Mayor Mallon thanked everyone and wished all a Happy Thanksgiving. The Committee adjourned at approximately 3:45 p.m.

Attachments:

City Manager Annual Performance Evaluation Process

City Manager Performance Review Template-Performance Categories

Clerk's Note: The City of Cambridge/22 City View records every City Council meeting and every City Council Committee meeting. This is a permanent record. The video for this meeting can be viewed at:

https://cambridgema.granicus.com/player/clip/360?view_id=1&redirect=true&h=68207c8a583ad6feddefb55ccd2a3cc3

All meetings are “closed captioned”. After each meeting the “closed captioned transcripts” are available online at: <https://app.box.com/s/9qormcahynjt4pzpt1n5opixogl3q7k5> Please note that there is no editing of these “closed captioned transcripts” and they do not constitute a verbatim transcript prepared by a certified transcriber.

I. Discussion

A communication was received from Vice Mayor Mallon, transmitting City Manager Draft Annual Performance Review Template and City Manager Annual Performance Review process.

City Manager Annual Performance Evaluation Process

- Proposed next steps
 - Tuesday 11/22 **Government Operations, Rules and Claims Committee** – Review draft of City Manager annual performance evaluation process
 - Monday 12/5 **regular City Council Meeting:**
 - Final plan put forward to City Council as an agenda item for discussion and possible adoption (materials due to the Clerk by Thursday 12/1)
 - City Manager will submit a 90 day report for the 12/5 City Council meeting as an agenda item. This report will be tied to performance categories pulled from the Leadership Profile developed during the City Manager process. The report will include an update on work he has started doing work across those categories. He will also share opportunities and challenges, what he's learned and what work he will be putting forward in the short and long term.
- Draft of City Manager Annual Performance Evaluation Process
 - Each year by February 15, the City Council and City Manager will approve shared annual goals, the performance evaluation process and timeline, and City Council survey or written template with appropriate evaluation metrics
 - The Mayor will designate an City Manager Performance Evaluation Ad Hoc Committee with a chair to coordinate the process by February 15th annually
 - The Ad Hoc Chair will meet with the City Manager to review goals by June 30th annually, to provide an opportunity to check in mid way through the year
 - The City Manager will submit a self-review to the Ad Hoc by November 15 annually
 - The Chair of the City Manager Performance Evaluation Ad Hoc Committee will gather feedback from the City Council through survey or written template on the City Manager's performance, in the form of appropriate evaluation metrics
 - An outside, independent, vendor will perform a climate survey of all City employees in August/September annually
 - 360 reviews from direct reports will be collected in November. Direct reports include the Deputy City Manager, Assistant City Managers, City Solicitor, DEI Director, Chief People Officer, Police Commissioner, Fire Chief etc. with an agreed set of 10 questions
 - The Chair of the City Manager Performance Evaluation Ad Hoc Committee will write a consolidated review of the employee Climate survey, 360 reviews and input from the City Councillors on shared goal metrics
 - The written review will be provided to the City Manager at least 48 hours in advance of the open session
 - The review will be delivered to the City Manager in open session by December 20th annually
 - There will be an opportunity for the City Manager to respond both verbally during open session and in writing afterwards if desired

- Performance template
 - Attached draft performance template is a structure for shared goals and key areas of responsibility, based on the initial City Manager job description. Specific areas of work (e.g., Universal Pre-K, affordable housing, etc.) would be part of the shared goals conversation in February annually, and have clear measurements tied to them.

City Manager Performance Review Template – Shared Goals

Shared goals to be developed and agreed to by City Manager and City Council by February 15 of each year. The City Manager will report results against each measurement as part of the self-assessment submitted by November 15. The number of shared goals should not exceed 10.

Measures

[illegible]

City Manager Performance Review Template – Performance Categories

Ratings: 4=Exceeds Expectations, 3=Met Expectations, 2=Partially Met Expectations, 1=Did Not Meet Expectations

Area	Rating	Rationale
Leadership: Effectively carry out the vision and direction set by the City Council including through development of goals and strategies		
City Council Relationship: Establish a collaborative and transparent working relationship with the City Council		
Management: Develop a strong City organization that has the people, processes, and systems to deliver on day-to-day operations and existing and new initiatives		
Community Engagement: Proactively communicate with the community, and create a range of opportunities for all stakeholders and residents to provide input and feedback, particularly communities whose voices are not typically heard by City Hall		
Culture: Define and establish a healthy culture across the City that fosters collaboration, trust, empathy, and effective and efficient decision making		
DEI: Advance anti-racism, diversity, equity, and inclusion efforts across the City, including strategy, organizational culture, HR, policy development, and service delivery		
City Operations: Oversee effective delivery of resident services including day-to-day operations, maintaining city infrastructure, and major capital projects		

Area	Rating	Rationale
Fiscal Management: Provide effective financial management and oversight of the budget, ensuring fiscal stability while allocating resources to meet community needs		

Overall Assessment

The City Council will provide a high-level summary that synthesizes feedback on performance regarding shared goals and the key responsibilities outlined above. This will include:

- An overall rating assessment across a four-point scale (4=Exceeds Expectations, 3=Met Expectations, 2=Partially Met Expectations, 1=Did Not Meet Expectations)
- Areas of strengths and accomplishment
- Areas for growth and development