



POLICE REVIEW & ADVISORY BOARD

A Department of the City of Cambridge, Massachusetts

MEMO

To: Cambridge City Council and Yi-An Huang, City Manager
From: Brian Corr, Executive Director, Police Review & Advisory Board
Date: June 30, 2023
Re: Police Review & Advisory Board Report for the First Quarter of 2023

Pursuant to Cambridge Municipal Code Chapter 2.74.040(E), I am submitting this memo as well as the complete set of minutes from January 1 through March 31, 2023 and the public docket of complaints as of the end of the quarter.

In the first quarter of 2023, the Board held three public meetings, and one complaint was filed with the Board during this period. It is summarized as follows:

Complaint #	Date Filed	Type of Complaint	Status	Date Closed	Outcome
PR-2023-001	1/27/2023	Improper or Inadequate Investigation/Reporting	Open	n/a	Pending

Between January and March 2023, the Board's work included the following:

- The Board reviewed the FY 2024 Cambridge Police Department (CPD) budget before submission to the City Manager as specified in Cambridge Municipal Code Chapter 2.74.040(B).
- CPD Commissioner Elow attended the March 29, 2023 Board meeting to discuss key topics with the Board, with a focus on the CPD's efforts in the wake of the fatal police shooting of Arif Sayed Faisal in January. Discussion topics included the implementing body-worn cameras (BWC), having an external review of de-escalation training and work, and how the Board can provide input into those efforts.
- The Board has received five draft CPD policies for review, including the draft policy governing the use of body-worn cameras (BWCs), as part of the Board's goal of conducting a review of a minimum of two CPD policies.



POLICE REVIEW & ADVISORY BOARD

A Department of the City of Cambridge, Massachusetts

Minutes from the Meeting of January 25, 2023

Board Members present: Gina LaRoche, Lucy Murray-Brown, Beverly Sealey

City Staff present: Executive Director Brian Corr; CPD Director of Professional Standards, Training and Certification James Mulcahy; CPD Sergeant Michael LeVecque

Acting Chair LaRoche called the meeting to order at 6:08 p.m.

Acting Chair LaRoche briefly stated a summary of the Board's role and purpose:

- The Police Review & Advisory Board provides a prompt, impartial and fair investigation of complaints brought by individuals against members of the Cambridge Police Department. The Police Review & Advisory Board was established by Cambridge City Ordinance in 1984 to:
 - Provide for citizen participation in reviewing Police Department policies, practices, and procedures;
 - Provide a prompt, impartial and fair investigation of complaints brought by individuals against members of the Cambridge Police Department; and
 - Develop programs and strategies to promote positive police/community relations and to provide opportunities for expanded discussions, improved understanding, and innovative ways of resolving differences.

Public Comment

Sue Reinert, a reporter for Cambridge Day, stated that she was recording the meeting.

Review and Approval of Minutes

The Board voted unanimously by roll call vote to approve the minutes of December 7, 2022, on a motion from Board Member Murray-Brown, seconded by Board Member Sealey.

Executive Director's Report

- Exec. Dir. Corr provided an update on the process for filling vacancies of the Board:
 - Update on Board vacancy: The City Manager's Office received almost 30 applications for the two vacancies on the Police Review & Advisory Board (the "Board"), posted on November 9 and closing on December 12. Interviews took place during mid-December.
 - Under the city charter, the City Council votes on whether to approve the City Manager's proposed appointments to City boards and commissions. Between the number of boards and commissions with pending appointments that need to go to the City Council and the fact that there are only three City Council meetings scheduled between December 19, 2022 and February 6, 2023 and tragically, the recent officer-involved fatal shooting of Sayed Faisal, the City Manager has not yet made recommendations to the Council for their approval. Exec. Dir. Corr stated that he is hopeful that appointments will be made by the next meeting of the Board.
 - Exec. Dir. Corr explained that Chair Fallon would be unable to attend the next scheduled meeting on Wednesday, February 22 and asked if Board members would be able to attend if the date were shifted to Wednesday, March 1, and all board members present stated that

they would be able to attend, with the proviso that it begins at 6:15 p.m. The subsequent meeting will remain scheduled for Wednesday, March 29.

CPD Professional Standards, Training and Certification Unit Report

- Dir. Mulcahy noted that the fifth class of the joint Cambridge/Northeastern University Police Academy class started this month with a robust group of student officers from CPD and other agencies, including 10 CPD student officers. This academy class is in its third week. Dir. Mulcahy will be teaching classes on Constitutional law, criminal law, and criminal investigations.
- Dir. Mulcahy provided an update on in-service training for all currently serving CPD officers:
 - He reported that the class-based in-service training for 2023 has begun for all currently serving CPD officers, and each January the Unit begins training using the Massachusetts Municipal Police Training Committee (MPTC) curriculum of four courses. In the fall they conduct training on use of force and firearms certification.
 - In addition, each year there is a theme across the MPTC training curriculum, and this year the theme is trauma-informed policing, which CPD has been training on for many years. and they will cycle through until all officers have met their annual in-service training requirement.
 - In response to a question from Board Member Sealey about the possibility of board members attending in-service training sessions, Dir. Mulcahy explained that they are conducting the in-service training through MPTC's online training portal, and that there are parts of that curriculum which they could work to make available to board members and that CPD would need to set up MPTC accounts for them. The trainings will be available on-demand over the upcoming weeks and months until all CPD officers have completed this training cycle. He also noted that the CPD has a scenario-based training simulator which would be valuable for board members to experience.
- In response to a question from Board Member LaRoche the process of accreditation, Dir. Mulcahy reported that the Unit has finished rewriting all CPD policies and procedures, but there has been a delay with the command staff review, and that has delayed providing them to the officers. Dir. Mulcahy hopes to have everything done and so that CPD will be accredited by the Commission on Accreditation for Law Enforcement Agencies (CALEA) by early 2024

Briefing on the Fatal Officer-involved Shooting of Sayed Faisal from Director Mulcahy

- Director Mulcahy briefed the Board on the fatal officer-involved shooting of Sayed Faisal on January 4, 2023, reminding those present that as the City Manager, Police Commissioner, and District Attorney have stated, because this is an ongoing investigation, he is limited in what they can share. The District Attorney has jurisdiction over the investigation and has indicated there will be an inquest.
- Director Mulcahy summarized the events of January 4:
 - On January 4 at approximately 1:15 p.m., Cambridge Emergency Communications received a 911 call from a Cambridgeport resident, who had witnessed a man jump out of the window of a neighboring apartment and reported that the man was in possession of a machete. The caller said that he appeared to be cutting himself with both the weapon, later identified as a kukri knife and broken window glass.
 - Multiple paramedics and Cambridge Police officers were initially dispatched to the scene and located the individual bleeding in an alley behind a building on Sidney St. He was identified as 20-year-old Cambridge resident Sayed Faisal.
 - The preliminary investigation suggests that Mr. Faisal reportedly ran with the knife after observing police, traveling through several blocks in the Cambridgeport neighborhood before officers attempted to verbally engage with him on Chestnut St., requesting that he put the knife down. Mr. Faisal reportedly moved towards the officers while still in possession of the weapon.
 - An officer discharged a less-than-lethal sponge round in an attempt to de-escalate the

situation. That round was unsuccessful in stopping Mr. Faisal. He continued to advance towards officers in possession of the weapon. One officer discharged his department-issued firearm and struck Mr. Faisal, who was immediately rendered medical aid on the scene by officers until EMS arrived. Mr. Faisal was transported to Massachusetts General Hospital where he later died.

- At the conclusion of previous inquests, the Middlesex District Attorney's Office has made all information publicly available and has stated that will be the case with this investigation.
- Following the briefing, Board members asked questions:
 - In response to a question from Board Member Murray-Brown about how long he anticipates the inquest process will take, Dir. Mulcahy explained that he didn't have an answer, but the District Attorney has posted information from past inquests, and looking at those they range from a year to a year and a half. Each case is different and the amount of investigation and information gathering varies.
 - Answering a question from Board Member LaRoche about what actions could be taken internally before the end of the inquest process, Director Mulcahy indicated that given the legal process, there will be some waiting involved.
 - Board Member Sealey stated that she did not attend the January 12 community meeting about the fatal shooting at the Martin Luther King School and asked what the meeting was like and if any board members attended. Board Member LaRoche stated that she did attend, and that the meeting was well attended and she was present for the information presented by the District Attorney, City Manager, and Police Commissioner and the first hour of questions, she did not stay for the entire meeting due to its length.

Other Business

Acting Chair LaRoche asked if there were any complaints that were under investigation or pending before the Board, and both Ex. Dir. Corr and Director Mulcahy indicated that there were no pending complaints received by the Board or by PSU.

Adjournment

The Board voted unanimously by roll call vote to adjourn the meeting at 6:38 p.m., on a motion from Board Member Murray-Brown, seconded by Board Member Sealey with board members LaRoche, Murray-Brown, and Sealey voting in favor.

Documents Used During the Meeting

- Police Review & Advisory Board Meeting Minutes of December 7, 2022



POLICE REVIEW & ADVISORY BOARD

A Department of the City of Cambridge, Massachusetts

Minutes from the Meeting of March 1, 2023

Board Members present: Chair Alexandra Fallon, Gina LaRoche, Lucy Murray-Brown, Beverly Sealey

City Staff present: Executive Director Brian Corr; CPD Director of Professional Standards, Training and Certification James Mulcahy; CPD Sergeant Michael LeVecque

Chair Fallon called the meeting to order at 6:17 p.m.

Public Comment

There were no comments from members of the public.

Review and Approval of Minutes

The Board voted unanimously by roll call vote to approve the minutes of January 25, 2023, on a motion from Board Member LaRoche, seconded by Board Member Murray-Brown.

Executive Director's Report

- Exec. Dir. Corr reported that he attended the annual conference of Riverside Trauma Center, which has been a partner of the City for well over a decade in responding to traumatic events, and that it was a valuable training opportunity with sessions on how to support community recovery and resilience.
- Exec. Dir. Corr explained that the City Council raised two issues regarding the ordinance establishing the Police Review & Advisory Board during the special City Council meeting held on January 25, regarding the fatal office-involved shooting of Sayed Faisal on January 4, 2023:
 - He stated that the "Duties" section of the ordinance states, "The Board and the City Council shall review the Department budget before it is submitted to the City Manager;" and that to his knowledge neither of those reviews has ever occurred since the Board was formed in 1984.
 - He explained that the City Council adopted a policy order stating that the Finance Committee of the City Council will review the CPD budget before submission to the City Manager, and that once that document is provided to that committee, it will be a public document and he will transmit it to the Board.
 - He stated that he anticipates that the review will take place during the March 29th meeting of the Board and that CPD Commissioner Christine Elow and Director of Planning, Budget and Personnel Manisha Tibrewal could be invited to present the budget to the Board.
 - Board members expressed interest in having a five-year retrospective understanding of the CPD budget and recognized that because this is the first time the Board will be doing such review, it will be more of an opportunity to learn more in depth about the CPD budget. Board member LaRoche asked that the budget be provided to Board members no later than 3:00 PM on March 24.
 - Exec. Dir. Corr noted that the City Council also asked about the provision in the ordinance stating that "The Board shall make quarterly reports to the City Manager, the Mayor, City

Council and to the public, of the Department's activities during the previous year, including the handling of complaints, and of future plans. The final disposition of complaints shall be made public.”

- He explained that such reporting had not happened in more than two decades, if it ever did, as the docket of complaints has always been publicly available and the minutes of the Board meetings and information in the City’s annual budget contained all of the relevant information.
- In response to the City Council’s inquiry, he compiled the information for the previous period into one document and submitted a report to the City Manager on and that was transmitted to the City Council on February 1, and which he also shared with the Board. The City Council referred the report to its Public Safety Committee along with two reports from the CPD, however the meeting of that committee had not yet been scheduled.
- In response to a question from Board Member LaRoche about whether the City Manager had proposed individuals to the City Council to fill the two vacancies on the Board, Exec. Dir. Corr noted that had not yet happened, but that it would likely occur after the Public Safety Committee meeting has taken place.
- In response to a question from Chair Fallon as to whether there were any complaints that were under investigation or pending before the Board, and both Exec. Dir. Corr and Dir. Mulcahy indicated that there was one complaint received by the Board in January and it is under investigation by PSU.

CPD Professional Standards, Training and Certification Unit Report

- Dir. Mulcahy reported that the current class is proceeding at the joint Cambridge/Northeastern University Police Academy and he is teaching classes on Constitutional law as well as on criminal law, procedures, and investigations.
- Dir. Mulcahy reported that the CPD Command Staff is almost finished their review of the entire procedure and policy manual, which will then be sent to the entire department for review, noting that Sgt. LeVecque has put a great deal of work on this process. This is the first step needed to be accredited by the Commission on Accreditation for Law Enforcement Agencies (CALEA), but then there are more than 1,400 proofs of compliance that CPD is documenting and will be made available to CALEA. Dir. Mulcahy hopes those reviews will be accomplished within 45 days, and then there will be continuous work to receive accreditation.
- In response to questions about the training for the Board, including visiting the Training Academy while in session, Dir. Mulcahy indicated that he would look at the schedule and see what might be possible.

Discussion of CPD Policies to Consider Reviewing

- Chair Fallon opened the discussion, reminding Board members that the Board’s annual goals for 2023 included reviewing at least two CPD policies and that the draft table of contents for the CPD policy manual had been shared with the other information for the meeting. She asked Exec. Dir. Corr to share his thoughts on what policies might be of interest to the Board and he mentioned several that might be helpful or of interest. Board members shared policies that they thought would be of interest, and then Dir. Mulcahy noted policies that he thought might be helpful or of interest.
- Board members asked clarifying questions about the definition of certain terms, the general content of certain policies, and reflected on what policies might be related to the types of complaints most commonly received by the Board. PSU staff addressed those questions, including a detailed explanation of how officers are dispatched by the City’s Emergency Communications Department (ECD) and when officers have the ability to respond to a call and let ECD know they are responding. Based on that interest, Dir. Mulcahy suggested that Board might benefit from a presentation by ECD director Christina Giacobbe.
- Board members discussed a number of policies and settled to two that were most interesting –

the CPD Code of Conduct and the Internal Affairs policy – and two more that they would like to review if there is time – the policies on Mental Health Issues and on Use of Force.

- Dir. Mulcahy indicated that he would provide the draft policies to Exec. Dir. Corr to submit to the Board for review.

Board Chair's Report

- Board Chair Fallon discussed the possibility of the Board holding an in-person retreat that would not be in the form of a public meeting to build and strengthen interpersonal relationships and the enhance ability of the board members and staff to work together, and board members expressed support for the idea.
 - Exec. Dir. Corr explained that he believes it is permissible to do a retreat as long as it conforms with the Massachusetts Open Meeting Law (OML) and that would mean no matters that should be done in a public meeting could be discussed, and that it might need to be focused on training. He stated that he would consult with the City's Law Department to ensure that this could be done, and if so, how to do it in accordance with the OML.
- Board Chair Fallon reflected on the discussions about CPD implementing body-worn cameras (BWCs) and how that would affect the work of the Board, and noted the need for training on the topic.
 - Dir. Mulcahy noted that there are a number of training programs – both in-person and online – on the use of BWCs, on policies for their use, and on retention of footage. Exec. Dir. Corr noted that there could also be a need for board members to receive training on how to view and understand BWC footage, including what it shows and doesn't show.

Consideration of NACOLE Code of Ethics

- Chair Fallon opened the discussion, and Exec. Dir. Corr noted that in late 2022 he suggested to Chair Fallon that the National Association for Civilian Oversight of Law Enforcement (NACOLE) encourages civilian oversight agencies to adopt its Code of Ethics and this it could be valuable for the Board to consider adopting them. Chair Fallon noted that these were discussed at the December 2022 meeting and were received favorable, but Board members felt it was important to have all Board members present and give them thorough consideration.
- Board members discussed the merits of the provisions of the Code, the commitments that living up to the Code would entail, and that it should not be something adopted and then not thought of again.
- Board members discussed the amount of additional work it might mean for Board members to live up to the Code, and how that might impact current and future Board members.
- Various ideas were discussed for holding the Board accountable to the Code. There was further discussion about how the Code's various provisions may apply to Board and staff as individuals, some to the work of the Board members as a body, some to the work of the staff, and some to the Police Review & Advisory Board as a department of the City of Cambridge.
- The Board ended its deliberation without a vote, with the intention to continue to consider adoption of the Code.

Adjournment

The Board voted unanimously by roll call vote to adjourn the meeting at 8:36 p.m., on a motion from Board Member LaRoche, seconded by Board Member Murray-Brown.

Documents Used During the Meeting

- Police Review & Advisory Board Meeting Minutes of January 25, 2023
- NACOLE Code of Ethics
- Draft Table of Contents for revised CPD Policy Manual



POLICE REVIEW & ADVISORY BOARD

A Department of the City of Cambridge, Massachusetts

Minutes from the Meeting of March 29, 2023

Board Members present: Chair Alexandra Fallon, Maria Arlotto, Brendan Koscher, Gina LaRoche, Beverly Sealey; past member Lucy Murray-Brown

City Staff present: Executive Director Brian Corr; CPD Commissioner Christine Elow; CPD Director of Planning, Budget and Personnel Manisha Tibrewal; CPD Director of Professional Standards, Training and Certification James Mulcahy; CPD Lieutenant Thomas Glynn

Chair Fallon called the meeting to order at 6:02 p.m.

Public Comment

There were no comments from members of the public.

Thanking Outgoing and Welcoming New Members

- Chair Fallon thanked outgoing board member Lucy Murray-Brown for her nearly eleven years of service on the Board, her contributions, and her wise counsel. Other Board members and City staff also thanked her, and she shared words of thanks and appreciation for the opportunity to serve, how meaningful it has been, and left the meeting.
- Newly appointed Board members Koscher and Arlotto introduced themselves and then the other meeting attendees briefly introduced themselves and described their connections to Cambridge, their lived experiences around issues of policing, and their roles with the City.

Review and Approval of Minutes

The Board voted by roll call vote to approve the minutes of March 1, 2023, on a motion from Board Member LaRoche, seconded by Chair Fallon, with Board members LaRoche and Sealey and Chair Fallon voting in favor and Board members Arlotto and Koscher abstaining.

Executive Director's Report

- Exec. Dir. Corr provided a brief overview of the work of the Board including:
 - Monthly meetings of the Board, including executive sessions as needed to consider complaints pending before the Board;
 - Community outreach as a way to connect with the community, let people know about the Board and its work, and hear concerns in the community about policing in Cambridge;
 - Training from various sources, including the executive director, the City of Cambridge Law Dept., CPD, and the National Association for Civilian Oversight of Law Enforcement (NACOLE) through webinars and in-person conferences. He noted that training from CPD could include de-escalation training (ICAT), walk-alongs and ride-alongs with patrol officers, and visiting the CPD Training Academy.
- Exec. Dir. Corr noted that NACOLE's 2023 Annual Training Conference would take place from Nov. 12 to 16 in Chicago, and that Chair Fallon has indicated interest in attending. He noted that he could explore securing one-time extra funding for the new members to attend the conference if they are interested and able.
- Exec. Dir. Corr reported that Dir. Mulcahy provided four CPD draft policies for review by the

Board and that he anticipates that the new policy being developed for CPD use of body-worn cameras (BWCs) will be made available to the Board for its review in the near future.

- Ex. Dir. Corr stated that he will invite Christina Giacobbe, Director of Emergency Communications for the City, to present at an upcoming meeting about the work, role, and function of 911 system.
- He will resend the NACOLE Code of Ethics for the Board to consider at an upcoming meeting.

CPD Professional Standards, Training and Certification Unit Report

- Dir. Mulcahy stated that in the interest of time, he would forgo a report at this meeting as there were two other CPD-related items on the agenda.

Discussion with CPD Commissioner Elow

- Commissioner Elow provided background about the state of the CPD when she started as a patrol officer in 1995. She noted that at that time CPD was a traditional police department, focused on responding to calls and that their interactions were often based on whether an individual had broken the law and whether they could be arrested. She also noted that there was not an understanding of juveniles and vulnerable communities, nor a focus on supporting them. She explained that when Commissioner Haas joined in 2005, there was a new focus on collaboration, and CPD started to work with other providers and tried to identify young people who were struggling and work with the family and providing wrap around services.
- She described that now in 2023, they have the Clinical Services Unit (CSU) staffed by a licensed psychologist and three social workers, and they use a case management model. CPD also changed its approach to working with unhoused individuals, doing problem solving and connecting people to services. CPD now works with many vulnerable communities, in collaboration with other community partners. CPD is very focused on the intersection of substance use and mental health issues and how to help people who are struggling, with officers working in partnership with the CSU. CPD is working with the Middlesex County District Attorney's office to use the criminal justice system as a way to connect people to services and support instead of criminalizing or incarcerating them. Over the last decade CPD has become integrated into the community, rather than being an external force policing it, and they are resources for many of the most vulnerable members of the community.
- Discussing the fatal police shooting of Arif Sayed Faisal on January 4, 2023, Commissioner Elow reflected on the fact that she had not imagined that a tragedy like that would have happened in Cambridge with the training CPD has done with their officers on de-escalation and working with people who are in crisis. She explained some of the CPD initiatives that are underway in response:
 - The City has contracted the Police Executive Research Forum (PERF) to do a review of CPD's implementation of the ICAT de-escalation training, which was developed by PERF and make recommendations on any changes needed;
 - CPD is moving rapidly to procure and deploy BWCs and is working on the policy for their use and for the video they capture. She noted that BWCs will be an important tool for transparency and accountability, and can help to build trust, and that she will be looking to the Board for guidance on at the BWC policy, as well as helping CPD think about how to introduce BWCs to the community in a way that promotes community trust.
 - CPD is working on its procedural justice dashboard with the Center for Policing Equity, a research and policy center based at Yale University, that combines academics and law enforcement reformers. They will be helping CPD develop it and help with interpreting data on stops and disparities.
- Commissioner Elow stated that she would welcome having the Board examine the PERF review and ideally there will be an opportunity for PERF to appear before the Board to report and answer questions. She also noted that there will be a community-facing portion of PERF's reporting back to Cambridge and that the Board could be involved in that as well.
- In response to questions about BWCs, Commissioner Elow noted that it will be approximately

18 months before a full rollout of BWCs after policy development, procurement, a pilot, and training. She also noted that in 2020 the City was moving toward getting BWCs after discussions, but that there was never a clear decision to do so.

- In response to questions about non-police responses such as sending social workers to handle people in crisis and handling traffic stops, Commissioner Elow noted the complicated landscape, and that while there are no communities that would send a social worker into a situation with an individual in crisis with a large knife, this is an area that the City is actively working to address. She noted that Cambridge's new Community Safety Dept. will probably start its work with activities such as conducting welfare checks and similar things instead of the police, and that there are many other areas where a police response isn't needed. They are going to be working with the Emergency Communications Dept. which is adopting new protocols so that certain calls can be sent to Community Safety. She also noted that Massachusetts state law requires police officer to make traffic stops, but there are conversations at the City Council about submitting a home rule petition to the state legislature about that possibility.
- In response to a Board member expressing a concern about what are people's views in Cambridge about CPD and the Board, while noting that there are not many complaints received, Commissioner Elow stated that her experience Cambridge is a very vocal community, yet there are also people that say they have horrible experiences but don't want to talk to CPD, the Board, or to the City in general. She noted that the City always encourages people to come forward if they have bad experiences.
- A general discussion followed about people in the community feeling heard, increasing legitimacy of the Board and CPD, and increasing awareness of the Board and its work and role.
 - Commissioner Elow noted that most of the complaints that both the Board and PSU received are for behavior seen as rude or discourteous, and a discussion followed about situations where there is no violation of policy, but the outcome is not what anyone would like to see, as well as the need to help officers understand how to balance safety in uncertain situations with procedural justice and treating all with respect and dignity and communicating in a way that makes that clear.
 - Chair Fallon noted that it resonated that there are cases where there is no violation of policy, but there could have been a better outcome, and invited Commissioner Elow and the Board members to consider what the Board can do to share its ideas and understandings with CPD and what would a clear process be for CPD to receive and incorporate that feedback.
 - PSU staff shared how CPD training addresses those issues, including through scenario-based training, and that officers do experience significant amounts of violence and that training and CPD efforts like its Peer Stress Team work to mitigate the impact of that on officers and their behavior.

Review of Fiscal Year 2024 CPD Budget under Chapter 2.74.040 B. of the Cambridge Code of Ordinances

- Exec. Dir. Corr introduced this item by explaining that during the special City Council meeting held on January 25, 2023 regarding the fatal police shooting of Sayed Faisal on January 4, the "Duties" section of the ordinance establishing the Police Review & Advisory Board was raised. That section states "The Board and the City Council shall review the Department budget before it is submitted to the City Manager."
- CPD Commissioner Christine Elow introduced Manisha Tibrewal, CPD's Director of Planning, Budget and Personnel to share a presentation on the budget that had been prepared for the Finance Committee of the City Council
- Director Tibrewal guided the Board through the presentation, taking questions as they arose.
 - In response to a question about patrol functions comprising approximately half of the budget, Director Tibrewal noted that was typical.
 - In response to a question about the composition of the Family and Social Justice Unit,

Commissioner Elow stated that it comprises nine youth resource officers, six adult outreach officers, two victim advocates, two Domestic Violence detectives, as well as the Focused Deterrence Unit on emerging adults ages 18 to 25 where people are involved in violent or criminal behavior but not connected to services; and the CSU including a psychologist as director of the unit, two social workers, a case manager, two lieutenants and two sergeants.

- In response to a question about whether there are any cities that are good to compare to Cambridge, Director Tibrewal explained that questions had come from the City Council about why the Somerville Police Dept. (SPD) budget seems significantly smaller than CPD, but comparing the expenditures that make up the CPD budget to the same expenditures in Somerville (which are not shown as part of the SPD budget) and adjusting for Cambridge's larger population, the budgets are proportionally fairly similar.
- In response to a comment that there was not as much detail in the presentation as a business would produce with profit and loss statements and detailed line-item budgets, Ex. Dir. Corr noted that the full City budget contains much more detail as that this first review is the beginning of trying to meet both the letter of the ordinance and the spirit of it, and that the Board's feedback will inform how this is done in subsequent years.
- In response to a question about whether establishing the new Community Safety Dept. (CSD) means that CPD staff like social workers would move to that new department, Commissioner Elow noted that the need is for having them inside CPD will remain as they play an important role for the CPD does its work. Ex. Dir. Corr noted that the intent of CSD is to start with 6-8 responders and that it won't be 24 hours a day, seven days a week, and focus on the most vulnerable, many of whom won't work with the police or don't need police involvement.
- In response to a question for Commissioner Elow about how she sees the Board helping CPD in the creation and implementation of the budget, she stated that she did not have a specific idea at this point, and that she very much appreciates the thoughtfulness of the questions, and that CPD and the Board can look at what we need to do. She also noted that she appreciates the ideas about recommendations, especially when there are complaints of rude and discourteous behavior, as there are individuals who are harmed if they don't understand what happened or feel it was properly addressed.
- In response to a Board member asking about stipends, Ex. Dir. Corr explained that the ordinance establishing the Planning Board had recently been amended to allow for its members to receive stipends because they spend between 10 and 40 hour per month on the work of that board, but that members of other boards and commissions are not receiving stipends.

Adjournment

The Board voted unanimously by roll call vote to adjourn the meeting at 9:18 p.m., on a motion from Board Member LaRoche, seconded by Board Member Sealey.

Documents Used During the Meeting

- Police Review & Advisory Board Meeting Minutes of March 1, 2023
- CPD Presentation on the FY 2024 CPD Budget

Cambridge Police Review & Advisory Board Public Docket: As of March 31, 2023

Complaint #	Date Filed	Type of Complaint	Status	Date Closed	Outcome
PR-2023-001	01/27/2023	Improper or Inadequate Investigation/Reporting	Open		
PR-2022-002	07/07/2022	Improper or Inadequate Investigation/Reporting	Closed	10/26/2022	Cleared
PR-2022-001-II	7/18/2022	Improper or Inadequate Investigation/Reporting; Rude or Discourteous Behavior; Discrimination/Bias-based Policing	Closed	12/06/2022	Not Founded
PR-2022-001	06/14/2022	Improper or Inadequate Investigation/Reporting; Discrimination/Bias-based policing	Closed	10/26/2022	Cleared
PR-2021-003	09/07/2021	Improper or Inadequate Investigation/Reporting	Closed	01/26/2022	Cleared
PR-2021-002	03/29/2021	Harassment; Excessive use of force	Closed	09/22/2021	Cleared
PR-2021-001	02/03/2021	Harassment; Improper or Inadequate Investigation/Reporting	Closed	09/22/2021	Cleared
PR-2020-009	11/25/2020	Improper or Inadequate Investigation/Reporting	Closed	09/22/2021	Cleared
PR-2020-008	08/19/2020	Harassment; Improper Stop/Citation/Arrest; Improper Search/Seizure	Closed	3/31/2021	Cleared
PR-2020-007	08/17/2020	Improper or Inadequate Investigation/Reporting	Closed	11/09/2020	Cleared
PR-2020-006	07/09/2020	Excessive use of force; Rude or discourteous behavior; Improper stop; Discrimination/Bias-based policing; Harassment; Improper policy/procedure	Closed	06/22/2021	Partially cleared, 2 allegations substantiated
PR-2020-005	07/1/2020	Harassment	Closed	12/09/2020	Administrative closure (subject of the complaint is not CPD officer)
PR-2020-004	06/18/2020	Improper stop/citation	Closed	10/05/2020	Partially cleared, 1 allegation inconclusive
PR-2020-003	03/04/2020	Harassment	Closed	11/09/2020	Cleared
PR-2020-002	01/28/2020	Improper search; Harassment	Closed	10/05/2020	Cleared

PR-2020-001	01/20/2020	Improper or Inadequate Investigation/Reporting	Closed	07/29/2020	Partially cleared, 2 allegations substantiated
PR-2019-010	12/04/2019	Improper or Inadequate Investigation/Reporting; Rude or Discourteous Behavior	Closed	07/29/2020	Cleared
PR-2019-009	10/28/2019	Harassment	Closed	1/28/2020	Administrative closure (insufficient information provided to identify the subject of the complaint)
PR-2019-008	10/30/2019	Harassment; Rude or Discourteous Behavior	Closed	7/29/2020	Cleared
PR-2019-007	09/19/2019	Harassment; Rude or Discourteous Behavior	Closed	2/04/2020	Inconclusive
PR-2019-006	09/19/2019	Rude or Discourteous Behavior	Closed	7/29/2020	Inconclusive
PR-2019-005	08/01/2019	Harassment; Rude or Discourteous Behavior	Closed	12/04/2019	Cleared
PR-2019-004	06/12/2019	Harassment; Rude or Discourteous Behavior	Closed	10/03/2019	Substantiated
PR-2019-003	03/05/2019	Harassment	Closed	12/31/2022	Administrative closure (Late filing accepted 4/29/2019, complaint withdrawn for refiling but never refiled)
PR-2019-002	01/14/2019	Harassment	Closed	9/25/2019	Cleared
PR-2019-001	01/04/2019	Improper or Inadequate Investigation/Reporting	Closed	9/25/2019	Partially cleared, 1 allegation substantiated
PR-2018-010	11/19/2018	Miscellaneous	No Jurisdiction	1/31/2019	Administrative closure (complaint was not regarding CPD activity)
PR-2018-009	7/23/2018	Rude or Discourteous Behavior	Closed	9/27/2018	Administrative closure (subject of complaint was not a CPD officer)
PR-2018-008	7/13/2018	Rude or Discourteous Behavior	Closed	2/27/2019	Administrative closure: Alternative Resolution
PR-2018-007	7/13/2018	Harassment	Closed	3/27/2019	Administrative closure: Alternative Resolution
PR-2018-006	7/9/2018	Harassment; Improper or Inadequate Investigation/Reporting	Closed	2/27/2019	Administrative closure: Alternative Resolution
PR-2018-005	5/18/2018	Improper or Inadequate Investigation/Reporting	Closed	9/26/2018	Cleared
PR-2018-004	5/16/2018	Rude or Discourteous Behavior	Closed	2/27/2019	Administrative closure: Alternative Resolution

PR-2018-003	5/3/2018	Improper Procedure/Policy	Closed	12/6/2018	Administrative closure: (Submitted more than 60 days after the incident. No request for late filing from the complainant; administratively closed after 180 days)
PR-2018-002	3/28/2018	Rude or Discourteous Behavior; Improper or Inadequate Investigation/Reporting, Harassment	Closed	12/5/2018	Cleared
PR-2018-001	2/5/2018	Rude or Discourteous Behavior	Closed	6/27/2018	Administrative closure: Alternative Resolution
PR-2017-003	6/9/2017	Improper Search/Seizure; Harassment; Excessive Use of Force	Closed	9/27/2017	Cleared
PR-2017-002	2/10/2017 (Late filing accepted 2/22/2015)	Improper or Inadequate Investigation/Reporting	Closed	12/6/2017	Partially cleared, 1 allegation substantiated
PR-2017-001	1/4/2017	Rude or Discourteous Behavior; Improper or Inadequate Investigation/Reporting; Harassment	Closed	4/10/2017	Administrative closure: Alternative Resolution, Cleared
PR-2016-005	7/14/16	Improper or Inadequate Investigation/Reporting	Closed	4/10/2017	Cleared
PR-2016-004	5/19/2016	Rude or Discourteous Behavior; Improper or Inadequate Investigation/Reporting	Closed	1/5/2016	Cleared
PR-2016-003	3/3/2016	Rude or Discourteous Behavior; Improper or Inadequate Investigation/Reporting	Closed	6/29/2016	Cleared
PR-2016-002	2/11/2016	Improper Search/Seizure	Closed	10/26/2016	Cleared
PR-2016-001	1/5/2015	Improper or Inadequate Investigation/Reporting	Closed	9/21/2016	Partially cleared, 1 allegation substantiated
PR-2015-002	9/30/2015	Improper Search/Seizure	Closed	2/24/2016	Administrative closure: Alternative Resolution
PR-2015-001	2/13/2015	Rude or Discourteous Behavior; Improper Citation	Withdrawn	3/19/2015	Withdrawn
PR-2014-008	12/10/2014 (Late filing accepted 2/11/2015)	Excessive Use of Force	Closed	2/2/2016	Cleared
PR-2014-007	12/12/2014	Rude or Discourteous Behavior	Closed	2/2/2016	Cleared

PR-2014-006	12/2/2014	Excessive Use of Force; Rude or Discourteous Behavior	Closed	11/19/2015	Cleared
PR-2014-005	10/24/2014	Rude or Discourteous Behavior	Closed	3/25/2015	Inconclusive
PR-2014-004	5/21/2014	Improper or Inadequate Investigation/Reporting	Closed	10/31/2014	Cleared
PR-2014-003	5/15/2014	Excessive Use of Force; Rude or Discourteous Behavior	Closed	12/3/2014	Cleared
PR-2014-002	7/3/2014	Improper Procedure/Policy	Not Filed	2/11/2015	<i>Late filing not accepted</i>
PR-2014-001	4/17/2014	Rude or Discourteous Behavior	Closed	2/25/2015	Inconclusive