



HEALTH & ENVIRONMENT COMMITTEE

COMMITTEE MEETING

~ MINUTES ~

Wednesday, December 8, 2021

10:00 AM

Sullivan Chamber

the Health & Environment Committee and the Human Services & Veterans Committee met to discuss the redesign of Carl Barron Plaza with a special focus on the needs of the unhoused community and the ideas presented within communication #10 from the October 18, 2021 Regular Meeting.

attendee name	present	absent	late	arrived
Quinton Zondervan	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	
Dennis J. Carlone	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	
Marc C. McGovern	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	
Patricia Nolan	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	
Jivan Sobrinho-Wheeler	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	
Alanna Mallon	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	
E. Denise Simmons	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	
Timothy J. Toomey	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	

Mayor Siddiqui was in attendance.

>>> Quinton Zondervan - Chair: I call this meeting of the Health & Environment Committee and Human Services and Veterans Committee to order. the meeting is to discuss the redesign of the Carl Barron Plaza with a special focus on the needs of the unhoused community and ideas presented in communication #10 from the October 18, 2021 regular city council meeting. pursuant to Chapter 20 of The Acts of 2021 adopted by Massachusetts General Assembly, and approved by the Governor, the city is authorized to use remote participation at meetings of the Cambridge City Council. to watch the meeting please tune into Channel 22 or visit the open meeting portal on the city's website. Today's meeting will be conducted in a hybrid format. Members of the public may participate remotely or physically appear in the chamber to provide public comment. If you would like to provide public comment, please go to Cambridgema.gov/publiccomment to sign up. We will not allow any additional public comments signups after 10:30 a.m. Please take a role of the members present.

>>Anthony Wilson - City Clerk: this will be a roll call of members of both the Health & Environment Committee as well as the Human Services and Veterans Committee.

Councillor Carlone.

>> present.

>> Vice Mayor Mallon.

Vice Mayor?

We have to take a brief pause.

I think we are having a technical issue in terms of audio in the chamber.

>> Vice Mayor Mallon.

>> present and audible.

>> Councillor McGovern.

>> present and audible.

>> Councillor Nolan.

Councillor Nolan?

absent.

Councillor Simmons.

Councillor Simmons?

absent.

>> Councillor Toomey.

>> present and audible.

>> Councillor Zondervan.

>> present and audible.

>> there are six members present.

>> Quinton Zondervan - Chair: Any votes taken today will be by roll call. I also want to acknowledge the Mayor has joined us as well. And so I will start with opening remarks and then we will have a presentation from the city. I will start by recapping how we got here. On October 18, the City Council received a petition from 37 community members who use the plaza on a daily basis, including many unhoused people. They wrote that nobody has come to us to get our ideas, vision and input for the plaza. The plaza is a refuge for our large unhoused population and a very important place for many people in Cambridge who don't have family situations which provide them with the social interaction we all need as humans. They communicated to us that they consider the entire design to be hostile to them in the sense that it is intended to keep people moving away from the area. They asked us how we can spend millions of taxpayers dollars on a new plaza whose whole design is hostile to the very people and community members who use it daily. They also made a number of important suggestions on how the redesign could better meet community needs. Those points were addressed in the November 22 memo from our City Manager. It provided a lot of clarity about what the design as well as the outreach has gone into the project this far. It was a very helpful memo, however a deeper discussion is warranted. Especially given the assertion from the community members that they were left out of the process. I have no doubt the city staff did work on their outreach efforts and this is not a slight to anyone who has participated so far. We are not here to start over, but we need to make sure the unhoused community's perspective is heard as part of this process. When we received a petition from community members upset with the rollout of the bicycle lanes, we scheduled the community meeting to hear them out and this was no different from that. The perspective of the unhoused community is important to the success of this project and having this conversation will undoubtedly improve both the project and quality of life of the people who use this plaza on a daily basis. Both now and once the redesign is complete. Finally, I want to acknowledge the state of crisis our unhoused community faces. Every week my office gets calls from community members who need somewhere to go, which I also know is true for Councillor McGovern and many of my colleagues. Often we have no place for them to go. We've done a lot of work together to expand low barrier housing options, but we still have a long way to go. This conversation is about how the redesign can meet the needs of the unhoused community, but nothing will meet their needs like low barrier housing with ample services and that conversation has to continue.

I also want to acknowledge the unhoused community is facing an HIV epidemic. There is a cluster of more than 100 infections in the Boston area, mostly among people who use drugs. This is not discussed enough and it needs to be front and center in our mind as we have this conversation. With that I will turn it over to my Co-Chair, Councillor McGovern before we go to city staff for a presentation on the redesign of the plaza. Councillor McGovern?

>> Councillor McGovern: Thank you Councillor. I will be brief. Thank you everyone for being here. We want to make sure that the plaza and the redesign is going to create a space that is welcoming to everybody, including those folks who use it primarily today and having the opportunity to hear more directly from that community is really important. I want to thank the folks who participated so far in the community process. I know it has been long and as Councillor Zondervan said, this is not meant to start over or to say that that process wasn't important or that people didn't work hard. But we want to make sure we are hearing from everyone as best we can and I think there are things we can do in the design that can make this project even better and meet a lot of the needs of folks in the community. I would say to Councillor Zondervan second point, there are, we know we have a crisis here in Cambridge, a housing crisis here in Cambridge and a large unhoused population here in Cambridge that needs housing and other services. This plaza certainly isn't going to solve all of those issues but can be an important piece of the puzzle in making sure folks have access to things they need in the community and feel they are welcomed members of our community. I'm looking forward to the conversation. Just a quick update on the task force that the Mayor set up that is being facilitated by me on the unhoused community in

Cambridge. That report will be coming out hopefully within the next couple weeks and although we don't talk specifically about the plaza, we do talk about a number of the other issues with recommendations to the city. This is one piece of a much larger puzzle in order for us to make sure we are supporting everybody in our community. And so thank you mr. cochair and I will yield back.

>>Quinton Zondervan - Chair: with that we will go to the City Manager and staff for a presentation.

>> Kathy Watkins: through you Mr. Chair, City Manager, I don't know if you want to say anything or you want us to start the discussion.

>> Louis DePasquale - City Manager: I wasn't going to speak, but I'm happy to make this presentation. This is hopefully going to be helpful to everybody and so thank you and I will turn it over to Kathy.

>> Kathy Watkins: These are a little awkward to do remotely when we are all trying to coordinate. Kathy Watkins from Public Works and I want to do a high level overview for folks; we really have a significant infrastructure project on River Street that provides a lot of opportunities to make significant improvements to both River Street as well as Carl Barron Plaza. We have had a really great team working on this project, from Community Development, doing a lot of the outreach efforts, Public Works focusing on infrastructure and design details and then also working with the Traffic Department. In the groups we work with, we had a working group that has really committed a lot of time and effort that has been extremely thoughtful helping us through a lot of these design details. One thing I would say is we are going to have a couple different presentations, a couple different folks presenting. We will start with Jerry Friedman who is going to give an overview about the overall project and then Bill from the Community Development Department is going to go through the details of the process to date and then we will have Brian from the design team go through the detailed design and really focusing on Carl Barron Plaza. That is the high level overview. We are excited to have an opportunity to go through the details of what we think is a really great project and appreciate any feedback about additional tweaks we can make. But I really think this is a really great design and happy to continue to incorporate additional modifications and thinking through how to make this the best project we can and looking to go into construction next year. And so with that we will turn it over to Bill, Jerry, and Brian. I think there was some discussion about who was sharing the screen so I don't know if that has been resolved. Bill, if you have the screen you can share it with the presentation.

>> Jerry Friedman: In the meantime, I can start. Jerry Friedman from the Department of Public Works. I am the public worksite public manager for the project and I want to spend a few minutes placing the plaza design in the context of the overall River Street project reminding folks it is part of a larger project and if we can get to a slide that shows the map. As you know, the River Street project is the entire section from Memorial Drive through Central Square, including Carl Barron Plaza. Really two different projects as we proceed with the public outreach and the design. We see the corridor there outlined in blue and then the Carl Barron piece. We were able to focus our public outreach on each piece independently, even though they will be constructed as a single project. The next slide is just a reminder that it's a very comprehensive project, particularly the River Street part. We are looking at moving the overhead wires away from utilities, replacing aging infrastructure and rehabilitating water mains and sewers and drains. All new roadways, sidewalks and separated bike lanes, and brand-new lighting system, all sorts of pedestrian amenities. It is a comprehensive project from bottom to top.

If you go to the next slide, which is just a little bit of where we are on the project. As I mentioned, we split out the corridor design itself because that was a different kind of design. That is at about 100 percent design right now and ready to put out to construction and then be much more complicated of course on a slightly more deliberate timeline. We completed the conceptual through midpoint design of that and had reviewed that with the working group. That's what you're going to see in a few slides from now; we are working on the final design to bring that up to the same level of completion. Our plan is to hold another general public meeting.

The showcase of both the design and the Carl Barron design is a complete picture giving people a chance to see the final details and then put the project out to bid again as a single contract over the winter 2022. We hope to start construction in the spring with the underground utility work. Eversource gas has been out there doing their work. It is a complex and long project. We are looking at 30 months or more of work. not only one place at one

time. up and down the corridor in bits and pieces and we can talk more about that as we get into a discussion of construction management a little bit later. That is sort of the overall context and status.

>> Bill Deignan: Thanks Jerry. Bill for the Community Development Department and the project manager for the plaza project; happy to be here today to talk about our community and stakeholder engagement process, which has happened over the last three years. This has been an extensive process we have used many different avenues to reach people that we will talk to a little bit more about over the last three years. would think that that has resulted in a good design that has a good deal of support. certainly it could use tweaking in areas and we are happy to talk about that. As we mentioned in the report given to council, we had extensive outreach in many different ways during this process, including at the beginning of the process 17 in-depth interviews that focus on the plaza itself along with individuals who use the plaza who live nearby, social service providers and others. We also did walking tours in the corridor and plaza with anybody who wanted to join. Some of those were our working group, some of them were neighbors and we heard feedback from people about the specifics about what they liked and didn't like and what they wanted to see. We also had two on-site in-person events before the pandemic that were on the plaza itself where we had boards up and places for people to write down on sticky notes what they like, what they don't like about the plaza, but they would hope for. One of those events extended into the Manning Apartments into the meeting room we heard from other folks there. We also had four public meetings. Two in person and to promote and to those meetings specifically focused on the plaza design with excellent participation even in the online meetings where we heard a lot of great feedback from people. A lot of that is on the River Street website where we had comments that people left. As Kathy mentioned, we also had a 16 working member group that was with us during this entire process and provided us with a terrific amount of feedback and guidance as we worked through the design and in the last two years really focusing on the plaza design. These meetings were held virtual, and in person. About half of them in the Manning Apartments we had a lot of seniors and other folks in that immediate neighborhood to join those meetings along with the working group. In parallel to the working group meetings, we also started holding a series of stakeholder design meetings with different groups. You can see the list here including the cities urban design team where we talked a lot about the goals of the plaza from the way it looked to the human services team talk about the function of the plaza and how the different populations that use the plaza would like to see it function that way or function differently in the future. Along with that we had a lot of great help from the (Central Square) improvement district. Those meetings are ongoing with them. They also provided us with a lot of guidance on how to create a plaza that works for everybody. We are talking to them not just about design elements but about future maintenance and other things there. As part of those meetings we met with the buildings management and business representatives and those meetings are still happening. We were talking to them about what their experience is in the plaza but also how their small piece of property that abuts the plaza can really help engage with the plaza itself and if there are small changes there that could be made. Part of that group was leaders in the baptist church, which is right nearby. We want to make sure their frontage works with the changes happening in the plaza.

We also met with the Central Square Advisory Committee a few times. They have oversight of what happens in the plaza so their feedback was also very helpful. In this process we tried to create a multifaceted engagement process as best we could including the unhoused people who use the plaza every day. The second half of our engagement process has been tough since it has to be remote, which makes it more difficult but we still try to continue to get feedback from people in different ways. We created a process where we got a lot of very detailed feedback and we are trying to incorporate that as best as possible in this design.

There's always a balance but we've come up with a strong design for the plaza that tries to meet the needs of a very diverse group of people that use this plaza from the unhoused, businesses, to neighbors who pass through here every day. Everyone has different wants and desires and so we are trying to create that balance. I will turn it over to Brian to talk about the plaza design that has gotten a lot of strong support from our working group in the public we have shown it to but I think it is meant to make a strong statement to be a focal point for Central Square and reflect the artistic cultural nature of Central Square that will work for everybody. And so with that we are going to turn it over to Brian from Halverson who has been our principal designer and he can go through the details of that design and you can let me know when you want me to change slides.

>> Brian Jereb: Thanks Bill.

Hello everyone. I think we will start looking at the site plan. We established a number of goals throughout this process. I don't know if we necessarily have to run through all of these, but this was based on feedback from the community. The process Bill describes with a number of stakeholders in the race site visits and community feedback. They want the plaza to be inclusive, activated at all times, safe, flexible, which we will touch on in a number of cases throughout this conversation, attractive, multimodal, functional and all season. We did meet with the urban design staff and a number of stakeholders that Bill mentioned.

This is a strong desire to make this a focal point to represent the artistic character in the neighborhood. They wanted us to be bold and whimsical with the design and provide elements that are both physical distance and that our pedestrian scale using repetition within this space adds visual unity to the elongated plaza that you will see.

As for the site plan insults, we should start by orienting everyone to the plan. On the left-hand side of your screen is Green Street. River Street as planned north and on the right side is Mass Avenue. The existing plaza is on the right side of the screen in front of the Holmes Building and on the left side of the screen what exists today is a sidewalk along the Holmes Building in a series of best ways in that area that extends out toward River Street. As you can see, we converted that area into a larger plaza area and pushed the buses out into River Street, offering more gathering space in a couple of bus shelters you can see in the darker color.

Running parallel to River Street is a separated bike lane in the dark green color but the number six on a deck really adjacent to that is universally accessible primary circulation routes. Everything in the light gray will be the primary circulation throughout the plaza. You will note that part of the design has been designed to accommodate three different users. The first being those that are passerbys through the space we do have clear primary circulation routes throughout the plaza.

The second of those who may stay for shorter periods of time we accommodated seating along the whole length of the corridor associated with the ribbon, which we will get into as well as flexible seating for those for shorter stays. And finally the areas for longer stays at time which would be the primary plaza space in front of the Holmes Building and we have a smaller gathering space on the left-hand side on the greenstreet side of the plaza.

The two primary gathering spaces are designed to incorporate both flexible and fixed furniture. We will mention that a lot during this presentation. That is because there is a strong desire from the community to allow the space to be programmed at times as well. To have the flexible tables and chairs in there allow you to move them out as desired to accommodate larger programmed events. Both these areas will be under the shade of tree canopies throughout the plaza. You might not be able to see it on the bottom of the screen, but there is a note there that says there are 24 proposed trees in this design compared to what exists today of a total of eight trees. So there is a significant amount of shade gathering opportunity within the space.

Aside from that, you can see the ribbon itself is the blue element that meanders through the site and this is the element that helps us unify the somewhat elongated space as we mentioned. It is a bold thematic sculpture that we worked with an urban design group and many others to create a vibrant atmosphere in the space. We had a handful of renderings to share what that might look like.

Before you move on, I wanted to mention a handful of other amenities within the space.

There is pedestrian scale lighting throughout the space. There are bottle fill stations at both ends both on the Green Street and in the Mass Avenue into the plaza. There are bike racks, trash receptacles and even USB charging stations incorporated into all the bench elements in the plaza. And so we have that opportunity throughout the plaza as well.

Next slide.

So this is a view looking at the space from the Green Street & River Street intersection. You're going to get a sense of how dynamic that is as it meanders through the site rising above her head touching back down creating

fixed seating opportunities throughout. You also get a sense of how extensive the tree canopy is, we maximized the planting to the extent possible given utility constraints and everything below grade. But these offer shade gathering opportunities throughout the plaza, primarily again in the Mass Avenue into the plaza and a small one you see on the Green Street end of the plaza.

This is a view in plaza from Green Street.

Here again you see the ribbon sculpture itself guiding you and drawing you into the space. And on either side of that are the bus shelters, which we will touch on in more detail toward the end of the presentation.

Next slide.

This is a view looking back toward Green Street where we were looking and you can really get a sense of how bold and dynamic the structure is as it rises above her head and touches down to the succeeding elements throughout the plaza. In the background you can sort of see some of the fixed tables and chairs introduced throughout, this is for those who may want to stay for longer periods of time. They are more comfortable seating opportunities.

We mentioned previously the desire to have both flexible and fixed furniture. We reincorporated movable tables and chairs throughout the plaza. This offers a much more comfortable seating opportunity than typical fixed furniture which might be colder stone or wood top elements. What we mentioned earlier on was there was a strong desire to allow this to be programmable by adding this type of furniture throughout the plaza.

They can be removed as desired as we mentioned to accommodate larger programmed events. On the right-hand side you can get a glimpse of some of our larger sitting features, which are large wood platform seating elements that can accommodate all types of seating and gathering.

Next slide.

This is a view looking in the plaza from the intersection of Mass Avenue and River. You can get a sense of how dynamic the element is reaching out overhead toward the intersection and framing a gateway into the space. We have colorful seating in there added to make this space much more vibrant based on feedback from the community.

Another thing you can catch a glimpse of is the notion of the coffee or other that could populate the space to help activate the space year-round. At night we hope to enliven the space as well by adding perforated metal panels that are backlit, really creating an extending vibrant character into the evening hours from a design sense. we did carry the light under the seating elements as well to give them a sense they are sort of floating within the space.

Next slide.

This is another view just showing how bright and accommodating this space will be in the evening hours. One thing I haven't touched on, and I know this is a design element, but the ribbon has changed colors in number at different times and that is somewhat intentional. We do intend to commission an artist to determine what the color and pattern will be on the structure and what sort of local character we can enthrill based on that design and based on feedback from the community as it's implemented.

Next slide.

This is a view from the Mass Avenue head house around the corner from the sidewalk. The ribbon opens up again creating another gateway, potentially creating views and drawing you into the space. This one shows a broad view of how much seating is accommodated in the design. There is a significant amount of both flexible and fixed seating opportunities within the space.

Next slide.

This one is a little hard for me to see off my screen. This is just a slide to give you a sense of the number of seats within the plaza. On the left-hand side is the current seating and on the left-hand side is what is proposed. We find fixed seating, movable seating and some seating associated with bus stops. As you move left to right, you will see that what exists today are 71 fixed seats on the plaza. And we are proposing – 61 fixed seats within the plaza space.

There are zero movable seats on the existing plaza design. We have incorporated 44 tables and chairs and so on. Chairs primarily. And there is seating associated with bus stops, roughly 8 to 12 in the existing design and 14 or so on the bus plaza for totals of 79 to 83 on the existing plaza and almost 120 seating opportunities within the new design.

Next slide, please.

This is a slide to show you how the flexible furniture might look like and to bring the notion that we do plan to have these discreetly tethered to the table so they can't migrate throughout the plaza because there are concerns about tables and chairs popping up here and there that might get in the way of 88 circulation routes we want everything to move around on the plaza to offer different gathering opportunities. If people want to put tables together and form larger groups they have the potential to do so. But they can't migrate too far and cause many concerns.

What we also like about the type of furniture is they can be moved around the table to accommodate wheelchairs. A number of the tables will have only three chairs for example, to accommodate wheelchairs to access them as well.

There are a couple bus shelters on the Green Street end of the plaza. A small one on the Green Street site and another on the River Street side, enclosed on three sides, offering shelter from wind and rain and providing shade from the tree canopy above. You will note in this slide there is a little shelter on the right-hand side of the River Street shelter. This is for an operators booth built into that. And this shows you a little bit better view. On the right-hand side of that is the operator's booth and within each shelter is a number of amenities such as benches, seating. There is clear signage throughout as well as real-time information within each of the bus shelters.

With that I will turn it back over to Bill.

>> Bill Deignan: Thanks a lot, Brian. So with that we are happy to take any questions, have a discussion and I turn it back to you. Thank you Mr. Chair.

>>Quinton Zondervan - Chair: thank you. Do we have anyone signed up for public comment? We have one person in public comment. So unless my colleagues and clarifying questions, I suggest we go to public comment.

Councillor Toomey raised his hand.

>>Quinton Zondervan - Chair: Do you have a clarifying question?

>> Councillor Toomey: Thank you Mr. Chair. Just very briefly, thank you for the presentation. Looks very exciting. You mentioned the 12 working groups. I was wondering if at some point you could get us a list of those working groups. And just clarification on the participation in the disability community, especially, I would like to see what the participation was on this. If you could separate those groups and the different communities represented in the process.

Thank you.

>>Quinton Zondervan - Chair: Thank you Councillor. so we will go to public comment. We have one person signed up to speak. Lori?

>> Lori DiLiddo: I read the communication that the unhoused community submitted to the city and they outline a lot of needs that I believe they do need. And I believe the unhoused community needs a different place to be during the day. It is clear Cambridge needs a day shelter or community space to meet the needs of the unhoused community, however, I question the use of Carl Barron Plaza as a day shelter with no oversight and that is what it is and what it has been for many years.

The community that currently occupies the plaza is a population that has significant needs that require services, resources, and support personnel. Currently there is no oversight needed for this unofficial wet day shelter. The plaza is supposed to be a shared public space, but because of the smoke, drug, alcohol use, and fighting, it is not and it never will be no matter how many millions of dollars is spent on the redesign. Those of us who live or work abutting this plaza do not enjoy this public health consideration that other people throughout the city have as a right without question. This is unfair and negatively impacts our comfort and health. This is a serious health concern and I would like serious consideration taken about this issue.

We are constantly barraged with cigarette, marijuana and at times meth or cocaine smoke everywhere on this plaza, affecting even those residents who live on the upper floors. Anyone who enters the residences or businesses along the plaza must walk through a lot of smoke to do it. I hear people screaming and swearing at each other and all hours of the day and night and someday starting at 6:00 a.m. and going past midnight. Most every night groups of people get drunk or high on the plaza and make significant noise for hours, shouting at each other. Especially at the Green and Magazine Street section of the plaza.

Everyone, including young people, high school or college age knows this is the place to get high and no one will stop you. I fear we had no input into this redesign process and we are going to be put through two years of disruptive construction for a space we never use and even though we would like to be able to use it, we will never be able to use it in the future if this plaza continues to be used as an open air wet shelter.

>> Thank you, Lori.

>> Thank you.

>>Quinton Zondervan - Chair: and so we will now hear from Mr. Nelson who is here to represent the unhoused community.

>> Nelson Pereira: Can you tell me more about how members of the unhoused community were involved in the outreach and community process?

>>Quinton Zondervan - Chair: Is that a question for the staff?

>> Yes.

>>Quinton Zondervan - Chair: If the staff could tell us more about the outreach done to the unhoused community.

>> Bill Deignan: Sure. Through you, Mr. Chair. In pre-pandemic times when we were able to actually do in person events with people, we had a few different events on the plaza that were in person events where we actually gathered feedback from people. There were a couple of different times of day. One of them was an extended period of time that also extended to an event in Manning Apartments. During that time we had boards for people to give us verbal feedback as well as written feedback on what people would like to see in the plaza. We also did interviews with social service providers that are part of the process. Many of those are in-depth.

We also had ongoing discussions during the pandemic with the department of social service providers about whether certain design features of the plaza would meet the needs of the unhoused community out there. During the pandemic it has been more difficult to gather additional in person feedback from people. We had good representation when we were doing in person events. We are certainly happy to continue listening to more feedback.

>> Nelson Pereira: How did you improve the project based on any conversation you had with the unhoused community? Did you engage with the shelters to see if they could facilitate any conversations with the community?

>> Bill Deignan: I can't say we reached out to individual shelters to facilitate those conversations. We would still be happy to do that. There are still things to tweak this in the design. There were a number of things we heard from people that led to changes in the plaza design from the amount of fixed seating versus movable seating to things like making sure to include charging capabilities for phones and things, to having plenty of drinking water for people in the form of bubblers and water-filled stations. Shade was a big thing people requested that in the summer there would be opportunities for shade since many of the people are out there for long periods of time during the day. Having plenty of trash receptacles and other things were also amenities we made sure to include in the design that we heard from people.

>>Quinton Zondervan - Chair: Thank you.

>> Nelson Pereira: There is a 40 percent reduction in the number of fixed seating options on the Mass Avenue side of the plaza, from 65 to 38 seats. Can you tell me more about the seating? When will they be out versus put away? Who will be responsible, where will it be kept, and what happens to someone who is using it at the time it needs to be put away?

>>Quinton Zondervan - Chair: The questions are about the movable seating. There is a reduction in permanent seating. The question is about scheduling. When will they remove the seats?

>> Bill Deignan: The movable seating, it's movable but we don't intend to take it away except for special events. We intend to have it out there 24 hours a day in all seasons. Right now we don't have any intent to put it away at night. It will be tethered to each other and so we feel like that is enough of a way to keep it secure out there. And like Harvard Square in the plaza there, the seating is out there in the winter as well. We don't intend to move that. So while it is movable, it is in a sense permanent seating except for the special events.

>>Quinton Zondervan - Chair: Thank you so much. Mr. Pereira?

>> Nelson Pereira: Will the fixed sitting that does remain include hostile architecture?

>>Quinton Zondervan - Chair: Thank you. So the question is whether the fixed seating will have any hostile architecture or hostile design like bars that prevent people from lying down on it.

>> Bill Deignan: No, there will not be seat dividers. We don't consider the design hostile at all. There will be certain areas that will have armrests and some of the ends of the fixed seating. That is a feature a lot of people appreciate. They need to be able to help get themselves up and use armrests to help do that. But armrests will not divide the fixed seating. Just at the end of it.

>> Nelson Pereira: Narcan could save a lot of lives. You said further discussion is needed. I want to know what is holding the city back from installing this in the plaza.

>>Quinton Zondervan - Chair: Thank you for the question about narcan access and how we can access narcan 24/7 and what is preventing the city from installing it in this plaza.

>> Bill Deignan: There is nothing preventing us from doing that. We are just trying to figure out who maintains that. We have started that conversation with the BID. They said they are open to a conversation about that. We just haven't nailed down exactly who would watch over that and maintain it since it can be accessed. I think we are fairly confident we can put that someplace, we just need to figure out the maintenance of it.

>> Nelson Pereira: Will the city commit that the redesign will not include above ground sprinklers?

>>Quinton Zondervan - Chair: Thank you. So the question is about the sprinkler system.

>> Bill Deignan: It comes on all the time. We are definitely aware of the fact that people don't want to have an above ground sprinkler system surprise them or work them up. So we are working on the details of putting as much underground or having drip irrigation or something like that. The planted areas do need irrigation to survive but we will try to make all of it underground if at all possible. But we certainly won't design it so it is spraying on people who are nearby.

>>Quinton Zondervan - Chair: Thank you so much.

>> Nelson Pereira: Last question. Will the city please install outlets– so unhoused people can charge their devices? This is important for the community.

>>Quinton Zondervan - Chair: The question is about electrical outlets.

>> I didn't catch – looking to charge the phones, speakers?

>>Quinton Zondervan - Chair: Charging electronic devices.

>> Bill Deignan: Right now we have charging ports; usb charging for telephones and other things. There will be electrical outlets out there that will be accessible for events and things. Right now we don't have electrical outlets in the public way anywhere in the city that are generally available for any electrical use. And so right now we are limiting it to USB outlets for charging phones and things. This will be a different technology than what is there now, the solar benches. These will be hardwired into the electrical system so they should be available all the time.

>>Quinton Zondervan - Chair: thank you. There are some safety concerns with the USB devices in the sense they can transmit viruses and things like that. It is preferable to have full electric outlets. Also, the standards change all the time. There is less permanence in the USB port designs than there is in the electrical outlets. Thank you.

Do you have any further questions? Thank you so much for coming and for asking your questions. Do my colleagues have any questions for the staff? Councillor McGovern?

>>Marc McGovern: one of the issues with the plaza now are the sinking bricks which are partially because he of the vaults beneath the sidewalk. The city has said the vaults are the responsibility of the property owner and not the city, and so the bricks settle and become uneven. Are we going to be dealing with that in the plaza so that doesn't happen with the new design?

>> Kathy Watkins: I can take a crack. Kathy here. So with the new sidewalk materials there is a lot of concrete where people are walking. That would be the primary walking surface. One of the things in Central Square is the old brick detail has not held up well. Anywhere where we are doing brick or pavers, we get a more solid base and loss of that settlement, if you look at other areas in Central Square we've done brick replacement. A lot of the plaza area is concrete and concrete pavers that would really help to address those issues.

>> Jerry Friedman: I could also add, fortunately we do not have any of those vaults on the section of Carl Barron Plaza like there are along other sections. That particular thing is not an issue in this design.

>>Marc McGovern: Has it just been the way they were installed in the past that we see that ripple effect, not the vaults?

>> Jerry Friedman: The brick installation detail was on a fairly unstable base. Now on the sidewalk we do concrete base and the brick on top for stable, robust installation.

>>Marc McGovern: Through you, Mr. Chair. In terms of the narcan boxes, I know that a couple of years back there was, I believe the Police Department was looking into some pilot happening in different cities around the country to install narcan boxes in the city. I'm not sure what happened to that.

Now a lot of times this narcan is needed and folks don't have it on them. They run to the needle exchange on Green Street. If you are looking for folks to help monitor the narcan boxes, you may want to reach out to them since they are the de facto providers now. They may be available to help with that. Mr. Chair, are you looking for general comments at this point?

>>Quinton Zondervan - Chair: Thank you. We will go through any questions first and then we can come back.

>>Marc McGovern: Thank you Mr. Chair. I do think in terms of the outreach, it is always a difficult issue. I think the city tries to do as much as they can. We don't always hit the mark. I do think that it would be worth potentially going back and trying to talk to folks now who are still there, now that things have opened up a bit more. As much as we can still do while design changes are still being discussed would be good. And even asking for help from Albany Street. Give some surveys or something to Albany Street and have them ask their guests. Or the Salvation Army. Make use of the community partners out there who have those connections and that trust already to maybe get some feedback, I think could be helpful. I will pause for now, Mr. Chair. Thank you.

>>Quinton Zondervan - Chair: Thank you mr. co chair. I will go to Councillor Sobrinho-Wheeler?

>>Jivan Sobrinho-Wheeler: Thank you Mr. Chair. I was going to ask the team to talk a little bit more about what potential programming they envisioned for the plaza.

>> Bill Deignan: Hi, thanks. Through you, Mr. Chair. At this time we've been talking a great deal about programming the plaza, but we haven't gotten into any specifics. I think that is an area where we need to have more discussions about who is doing the programming and how things are funded. But it is something the BID wants to get more involved with. We think it would be a great thing for the plaza. But again, specifics. We've really been talking about making the plaza work for this since the current design does not work for programming. And then we would have a 2 to 3 year period (during construction) where we can work on the specifics of what that programming includes.

>>Jivan Sobrinho-Wheeler: Thank you. I yield back.

>>Quinton Zondervan - Chair: Thank you, Councillor. Any other questions from committee members? Councillor Carlone.

>>Dennis Carlone: Thank you, Mr. Chair. Obviously I will have comments when we get to the comment period, but we all know the city has a lack of open space. About 50 percent of the national average. So anything that is increased is great. But given all the pressures on this space, the needs and programming, what kind of oversight is there? In traditional open spaces we see in other countries and even some in our country, it is adjacent uses that oversee the space. For example, restaurants or markets. We don't have that condition at this location. So I guess the way to put it is how will the space be managed given all the different pressures and interests?

>>Quinton Zondervan - Chair: Does anyone on the staff have an answer?

>> Bill Deignan: Through you, Mr. Chair. Again, that is something we are still working on. I think they have an interest in doing some of that. I think the city will take some responsibility for parts of that. We are also talking with the Holmes Building, they have an interest in doing something in their little plaza adjacent to this. I don't think they will be doing any kind of management. But again, we are trying to get all the nearby abutters talking about this and how we can make this plaza work for everybody. So those conversations will be continuing during the construction period, which will again be 2 to 3 years.

>>Dennis Carlone: The design showed something I was very happy with. I don't know if it was real, but it showed seating on private land. Is that truly in the works at the entry courtyard?

>> Bill Deignan: Yes. We have been talking to the Holmes Building. We did present them with a number of suggestions to change their little plaza area that is part of the Holmes Building property. We have given them a number of suggestions about how that can be done in coordination with this work. We are still waiting to hear their feedback and what, if anything, they would like to do there. Of course whatever happens in terms of carts and tables and chairs and anything on the property would be up to them. But we told him we were open to working with them to make it as easy as possible to do something there.

>>Dennis Carlone: I would suggest that be highlighted in your presentation because it completely changes the front of the building. And if that doesn't happen we will have some of the same issues we have today. It is not the city's land, I get that. But the implication is that this pedestrian welcoming area is much bigger than it might be. I'm all for it, but I know that it is almost certainly not going to happen. Thank you Mr. Chair.

>>Quinton Zondervan - Chair: I see no other questions. I have a question myself about the tree canopy. And thank you for proposing to increase the tree canopy on the site. But there are concerns about existing trees. It says in your proposal that some of them will be relocated and other ones will not. Can you say more about which ones will be located and which ones will not and how you make that decision?

>> Jerry Friedman: The trees there now are in sort of unusual growing conditions. They are in these planters that unfortunately seem to limit the possibilities for redesign of the plaza in the way we would like. So the idea is to see if we can relocate some of those trees. It is not the intent to relocate them at this plaza and project, but to relocate them to other areas of the city where they might do well given the constraints. We are looking at which ones could be relocated elsewhere in the city before we start construction. The plan offers 24 new trees.

>>Quinton Zondervan - Chair: I do encourage you to relocate all of them if that is at all possible.

>> Timothy Toomey: Just to follow up from those comments, could at some point the staff provide us a breakdown of the percentage of the plaza that is city owned versus privately owned, just so we have an idea exactly who the stakeholders are on this plaza? Thank you.

>>Quinton Zondervan - Chair: Thank you.

>> Alanna Mallon -Vice Mayor: Thank you Mr. Chair and through you to the city staff. I found it informative. Thank you for all the work you've done by community members to bring it to this point. I wanted to follow up on something mentioned by you around the charging stations and the need for electrical outlets. Would you mind telling me or all of us the differences. This was something that came up in the memo. It was not just to charge phones but to charge wheelchairs, which I found a necessary need. And so just curious the concern is around the USB versus an actual electrical outlet.

>>Quinton Zondervan - Chair: Thank you Vice Mayor. The USB is a lower voltage and is a direct current system. The regular outlets are 128 volt alternating current. That is a much older standard used by many other devices like laptops, wheelchairs as he mentions, electric scooters. There are lots of other devices that can be charged on regular outlets that may not be able to be charged because of the limitations of the voltage or the current cycle of USB. I do understand the concern because if you put in the regular outlets people might plug in

devices that draw more current so that would be a higher expense to the city. I think this goes back to the question as well about managing the space.

Obviously if someone were to come in and want to charge wheelchairs, we should allow that. The people who come in and are trying to charge other kinds of devices that maybe we don't want to allow, there's a question of how we manage that. But I think it is important to take that into consideration. Because just putting in USB charging ports really does limit the types of devices that can be charged and that standard changes all the time. In 10 years there may not be any devices in a particular standard anymore, whereas the regular 110 outlets are unlikely to change in that time period.

>> Alanna Mallon – Vice Mayor: thank you Mr. Chair. through you, presumably there is going to be a need for electrical outlets for any arts or programming that happen in Carl Barron Plaza and the new spaces being envisioned. the bid ambassadors. there's nobody from the central square BID on the call, I don't think. The ambassadors are in and out of the Carl Barron Plaza all evening long and could be monitoring electrical outlets. Wondering if someone from the DPW can talk about the electrical outlets; what is possible and what is being envisioned for that space.

>>Quinton Zondervan - Chair: thank you Vice Mayor. They (Central Sq BID) were invited but they were not able to make it for today. Ms. Watkins?

>> Kathy Watkins: through you Mr. Chair, I can start and Jerry might be able to fill in with details. We really want to make sure there are electrical plugs that support events and that type of activity. And those would be included. Those are typically either raised up high where it's not easy to access. There are both safety concerns, waterproofing concerns and different issues.

>> Jerry Friedman: the plan does include what Kathy described. several normal electrical outlets for planned events or sort of authorized use. the intent to date and then to secure them to be used by the bid or by city staff, but that is something we can re-examine with the electrical department. We don't have public outlets of that sort in the city right-of-way as far as I understand, but it is something we've already physically provided for in the plan and now it is a question of whether they are accessible to all or restricted in some way.

>> Kathy Watkins: The only thing I would also add is the point you brought up about the BID being a potential partner in terms of managing those is really helpful because we do have concerns about having them open and what does that mean. If it is possible to work with the bid that to say during these times that they would help manage, that's really great conversation in terms of being able to provide electricity in a controlled way that people can feel comfortable and safe with.

>> Bill Deignan: Just to add through you, Mr. Chair, we talked with the disabilities commission about wheelchair charging. In terms of finding managed spaces where people can do things like that, they did point out people are able to do that when it's open and the senior center western avenue and a few other places nearby but of course that depends on the availability of spaces so it is not a 24 hour solution. They do provide the information specifically for people with disabilities in wheelchair charging.

>> Alanna Mallon – Vice Mayor: thank you to Ms. Watkins and the team at the DPW for thinking about re-examining this is working with the BID to see if there could be partnership on managing the electrical needs in the plaza. The other thing I had a question on, looking at the memo from the community that brought us here today, one of the things was a message board. I know the central square business improvement district has been looking at message boards throughout the district. <someone> also makes a message board and I've seen them and other bids across the state. Is that something we are looking at for this space? I didn't see it on the graphic. If so, could there be a space for message boards the unhoused community is contemplating in their memo?

>> Bill Deignan: Through you Mr. Chair, we have a spot on there. it's not called a message board, it's called a place for a possible future kiosk on the key plan. It's at the end of the plaza near the CVS. I would say that spot will be wired for a potential kiosk. what that might include and whether it is electronic or have some other face of it I could be more low-tech. That is something we thought about and chose a spot that works for that purpose

will actually be talking to the bid and others that gives community information that will take management as well as that would do the actual programming of what is appearing on that. again, another discussion that we don't have to have all of it nailed down to start the construction project, but we will be continuing to look at the details of that.

>>Quinton Zondervan - Chair: thank you.

>> Alanna Mallon – Vice Mayor: that is great to hear because I know it has been a long-term goal to have the signs placed out throughout the district for wayfinding or community messaging or events going on; glad to know there is a spot for that they could speak to some of the concerns raised by the and housed community about an actual message board. Thank you Mr. Chair. I will yield back at this time.

>>Quinton Zondervan - Chair: thank you for those questions. I don't see any other hands up so I will get a question in myself. on the fridge or microwave or some kind of kitchen type amenities, we have community fridges and other parts of the city. but there seems to be no proposal in this plaza to have those kinds of amenities. Is it at all possible? Is there some way we could make that happen?

>> Bill Deignan: again, through you. We talked about that, particularly with the bid and did research into those fridges out there now are typically managed by nonprofits as they do need fairly intense maintenance to provide the food commitment that is dropped off it also to clean out older food; really needs daily care.I think along with the bid we said we would continue those discussions and look for nearby spots in somebody who could do the maintenance of that and was willing to take that on.

>>Quinton Zondervan - Chair: thank you. the bid would seem like a natural partner on that. appreciate that conversation is happening. Any other questions for my colleagues? okay. So I have one more question on the construction process and whether the city will provide an alternative gathering space for people who gather in the plaza currently while the construction is happening.

>> Jerry Friedman: I will start with what will be in the construction contract and I will transition to another member of the team who might talk about what happens off-site. Safety is going to be our number one priority and we will work with the contractor to develop a construction management plan should we start by giving them parameters about what they can and cannot assume. one thing they cannot assume, for example, is to get to use that space for the entire 30 to 36 months of the project for storage of materials. We want them to only be there when they need to be there. one priority is going to be moving people through the space. It is important people from the neighborhood can get to the T; Holmes building folks can get an outcome of people can transfer from bus to bus and bus to redline. One priority is going to be to provide as much generous and direct access so that people are walking in a safe manner and not shortcutting streets and things like that. That being said, there will be times when the plaza is not available as a gathering place and that is what the construction contract will address; it may be someone else wants to talk about off-site things we could do.

>> Bill Deignan: I can talk about that a little bit. So we have started discussions about providing a space or looking at other spaces around central square that already exists and to see whether those spaces would need certain things added to them for recharging, usb charging, needle, sharps container here it is unclear to us in our discussion so far whether we could presume to know one exact spot that people will gather when the Carl Barron Plaza plaza is not available. There are a number of places people go now in smaller groups along the post office, along pleasant street, a little bit down River Street in the mass avenue section and Daily Table. There are different places where people gather. It is not clear to us if there's one place that would actually be the spot. We are looking at being ready to provide those things. If people need particular things at spots as they emerge as gathering places.

>>Quinton Zondervan - Chair: Thank you, that sounds good. I would suggest – there is also the if you build it they will come. If the city does provide certain amenities in a certain location people will come to that location. At least to get access to those amenities and that is and is also a good thing to do. I wouldn't necessarily wait entirely until construction is happening, because there can be a disruption in services there. If there are no further questions we can go to discussions and general comments. Councillor Carlone?

>>Dennis Carlone: Thank you Mr. Chair. From the outset, I want to say this is a very difficult project to pull off.

the geometry, the needs that have been expressed including bicycle integration and safety, removing roadway and integrating bus shelters. The site plan layout is excellent. I don't think there's anything harder to design than a public space with many needs for the public face of the building with many needs around it, and that should be applauded. I have concerns about the blue ribbon, the orange ribbon and I have expressed this at a meeting with the city team in the past that I requested, but looking at the site plan, is an excellent, well thought out and balanced approach. As I said, that should be applauded. Also on the site plan, the building courtyard is not turned into outdoor seating. And I think that is a fair representation. Should it be? Absolutely. There's no doubt in my mind if there was a way and it was at different times. For some sort of outdoor coffeehouse, restaurant location on the first floor would make all the difference in amending and overseeing this place. There are two things among others that are critical to make a public space in such a demanding location successful. That is oversight. And that is why I asked and I hope indeed the Holmes building, the BID group and city work out something. Because any existing issue as expressed by Lori that exists needs that. Doesn't mean removing everybody, it just means there has to be oversight and a sensitive involvement for that is number one. Number two is in such a space food, coffee, refreshments. And the notion that Bill brought up to read the possibility of in good weather, an outdoor kiosk that serves coffee and maybe light food is absolutely critical to giving a presence to the space. Clearly one group, whatever it is, doesn't control it. It's got to be that public involvement. Now, the likelihood of good oversight and introduction of coffee or food is probably less than 50 percent. But I promise you, it will be missing. If it is missing we will not be happy with the results of the space, no matter how handsome it is. When the design that is there now was done, everybody was raving about it. But the two issues I brought up were never resolved, never integrated. So that can continue. That is independent of the site plan. As I said, the site plan is very well worked out. My concern about the blue ribbon, and I get it isn't designed, is that it is going to look very strange in the future. Maybe when it's new, it isn't as exciting. But unless it relates to Central square in the energy and another to possibility in the design. But I have to be honest, and any artwork I've been involved in and I have been involved in about 10, half of them end up being nowhere near successful. This is critical that the quality of what has been described is absolutely ideal in solving the character issue and how it relates to central square and I would add on that maintenance. Metal elements are going to need enormous maintenance over time. Might look at for the next 10 years, but after that I question that. Lastly, the use of concrete. Concrete can be beautiful. London pavers in London last forever. We did concrete sidewalks like the one in city hall. This is the second time we would've done it in 20 years. Lines don't line up the quality of the concrete is never like most private construction concrete. I'm really weary of concrete use. We put salt on the sidewalk and we clean it off. So something to think about. I love the idea of movable chairs. That is what a public space should be. But how that is maintained and overseen is very critical here, especially if you want it to be a 24 hour use, or 18 hour use. I think the way the bus service has been redefined is a plus. No question about that. And I am sure he worked with the team on that. If I understand correctly, all trees are going to be fed water, drip or however, there is much greater success that they will mature to a decent size. I hope it is all trees and not just the ones in a bed of grass and groundcover. The issue about homeless people. This isn't just an issue about this space. It is how the city deals with daytime needs for the homeless throughout the city. And yes, we have to solve it for this space in a balanced way that doesn't isolate them but engages them. But we have to look at the bigger issue. Daytime services, not just leaving them on their own. Until we solve that we are not going to solve particular space issues, public space issues. As far as a temporary, during construction space for gathering, just look around. What is the closest accessible space. It is right in front of us, it's right in front of city hall. And that is the most logical that comes to mind for me to provide amenities that were talked about to the tune of years and please tell me where else makes sense if that is not the proper place. It is in the public domain, people like to be in a public domain where they see others walk by, they see friends walking by and not hidden in a small private courtyard off the main drag. In short, advocates, the landscape architects enormous credit for the way the plaza is organized with the public spaces organized is extremely well thought out and in my mind works for the courtyard to the homeless building is critical to read another critical element to make that space, life. Even if the Holmes courtyard is a private restaurant. It just adds to the life and oversight. I raised my issues and I just wanted to say what is very positive. Thank you Mr. Chair.

>>Quinton Zondervan - Chair: we will go to Councillor McGovern and then Vice Mayor Mallon.

>>Marc McGovern: Just in terms of the timeline, the 2.5 years, how long do we think the plaza itself is going to take? The 2.5 years is for the whole project, am I right?

>> Jerry Friedman: We anticipate 30 to 36 months; there's a lot of underground utility work to be up and down. We don't know exactly how long the plaza work would take. That would be something we work out with the contractor. I happen to think it won't be at the beginning of the project given the way these projects unfold. I think there will be activity toward Memorial Drive over the first year. I think it will be a while. But that is something it will be some fraction of the 2.5 years. What we plan to do on these projects once we have a construction schedule from the contractor is having other public engagements, to let people know what is coming and when and what the plan is.

>>Marc McGovern: As we are talking about providing other space for people, they won't need to find that temporary location. It will be a shorter period. I do want to follow up on something that Councillor Carlone said. And I mentioned this in my opening around this being a piece of a larger puzzle. We are talking about how we have fixed seating, benches long enough for people to sleep on. Well, people shouldn't be sleeping on benches, right? Referring back to the task force, the things finalized but one of the things that came up consistently and will probably be our top recommendation is around the drop-in center idea. That can provide a lot of the things we are talking about having Carl Barron Plaza provide. So hopefully that will be something the city will look at and consider and we can address a lot of these needs around whether it's food or charging or a place for people to go during the day. That can be handled not necessarily in the plaza itself but a different facility or facilities. I appreciate the design separate from any other concern around the behaviors that happen. I am in the plaza every day. We are walking through the plaza every day and see lots of things there that quite honestly I wouldn't necessarily go and want my little kids hanging around there. Even all that aside, the plaza itself I don't think is a terribly welcoming place. Forget any of the other issues. The benches are cold and if you want to eat there is no table. You have to put your food next to you. It feels very exposed, the street is right there. It feels like you are in the middle of traffic. The trees are great and I hope that we can save them as best we can and certainly we are adding more, which is great. But just in general, regardless of anything else it doesn't feel like a welcoming place; in this design, it seems a lot more welcoming to a larger group of people and will be a lot more comfortable. I am happy to see that. But I do think it is ultimately, when folks are bringing up the issue of who uses the plaza, part of that is we don't have other facilities for people to congregate and use in a safe way and that has become a community.

>>Marc McGovern: Thought community to have access and still be able to be there like everybody else, but it also does highlight that we need some other solutions to be there for folks. Most importantly housing of course and for those who can't get housing, a place to go during the day that can offer them the types of support that the plaza isn't going to be able to provide them. I'm happy this is moving forward; lived through western avenue construction. I still remember the big digital sign to expect traffic delays for the next two years. Gearing up for my neighborhood to be ripped up again, but at the end of the day we are going to have something really nice and I do love the pushcart idea. So we talked about this a lot in the years past and there's been resistance from the restaurants in central square around having food sold at kiosks and things. Result that would take away from the business, but I think it enhances the business and brings more people in; agree with Councillor Carlone on that as well. I am excited and keep reaching out, keep listening to people in this will be pretty nice when it is done.

>>Quinton Zondervan - Chair: Before we go to the Vice Mayor, we will hear from Mr. Pereira briefly because he has to leave soon.

>> Nelson Pereira: Yes. How are you doing? My concern is more about Councillor McGovern saying about centers and programs in order to go to, but I have been in this program. Sometimes I want a drink. You can't drink in these programs. That is when people go to the center. I live at the Y(MCA). you can't drink at the Y even though I pay rent! I pay rent but I can't get out of work and take a drink. What I do is go to the center. I know everybody so everybody hangs out. And then I believe he said something about going down to the riverside and hanging out over there. You can't even hang out because the police told us they can't be over there. If you sit at the restaurant, the police are going to tell you you need to move. We have nowhere to go, and I don't think that is fair. I don't drink like most of the people who get too intoxicated and start fighting. I

shouldn't be blamed for what they do. You are not just removing one person, you are removing everybody. And I used to stay in Green street and I've never seen anybody come there and speak to us about changing the plaza. So that is my statement on that.

>>Quinton Zondervan - Chair: thank you so much. This is why it is so important to make sure we are in conversation with you in the community so that what we design works for everyone. We will hear from Vice Mayor Mallon.

>> Alanna Mallon – Vice Mayor: Thank you Mr. Chair. I wanted to go back to something that Brian said around the ribbon; the lighting element, and that there would be some freedom and flexibility for whomever the artist is that is chosen to design and execute the structure. I'm wondering how much freedom the artist will have? Is it just color and texture? We don't have enough public art that is providing this kind of ambient lighting, which quite honestly is going to make a huge difference along that corner and in lightening central square, we've done a lot of work making sure the lighting is working good for the district. And so I am curious what kind of freedom this artist will have around design. Is the design done and they get to decide the color and textures or is there more freedom?

>> Bill Deignan: The call for artists has still not gone out yet, but the lighting element is certainly one that will have the ability to be programmed and change color as well as the programs in terms of intensity and changing. I think that's a great idea for the artist to be able to do that. Something we talked about in the big picture: could certainly change the lighting for events or different celebrations. But having the artist integrate that is something we are open to. I did want to mention that the initial idea is an artist would be engaged to create their vision with the ribbon that may change over time. So the idea is this is not necessarily a one time thing and that after a certain number of years, when there was an interest, the arts council would engage another artist to re-create the ribbon in the plaza so that it could reflect changes in central square overtime.

>> Alanna Mallon – Vice Mayor: Thank you Mr. Chair, through you. That brings up another point: we have one percent for arts for public projects. Is this lighting being envisioned less than one percent or is other public art being envisioned for River Street in this particular plaza?

>> Bill Deignan: Thanks for that. No, this is not the only art. There is another artist, [name], who is engaged in creating public art for the quarter. She was the artist who created the public art currently in Carl Barron plaza. That will be decommissioned as part of this. And she is re-envisioning pieces of that 4 at least three different locations up and down the plaza that will have a seat like element with some of those dream panels done in a new ceramic format. These will be colorful. And then she would like those paired with a cherry tree or to nearby. We are working with the city arborist defined locations. The identified locations and species for that through that is a public art element. This will be in addition to that.

>> Alanna Mallon – Vice Mayor: what is the total cost of the reconstruction. What would be the one percent?

>> Jerry Friedman: For River Street we are looking at something like \$30-\$35 million. And so the one percent she's using for her re-envisioning is one percent of that.

>>Quinton Zondervan - Chair: thank you Vice Mayor and thank you everyone for this very productive discussion. I do share some of the concerns and skepticism around the ribbon. I'm certainly open to the idea of it, but it does strike me as potentially challenging to maintain. The lighting can become overbearing if it's not done the right way. I guess I just have a lot of concerns about it and I wonder if there are other types of art projects that we could consider there instead, even if it is just for consideration so we can see this is the ribbon but here are some other possible art programming that could happen instead that might be preferable to the community overall. I also wonder if the plaza redesign is an opportunity for renaming some or part of it but maybe after a woman or a person of color so we have more diversity in naming as we discussed previously as well. Those are my initial thoughts but I appreciate everyone's contribution. I do agree that the design overall looks great and I'm very hopeful it will be successful and again appreciate everyone's participation, including and especially mr. Pereira; he couldn't stay until the end but I really appreciate his presence and bring that perspective to the community using this plaza on a regular basis through this conversation. Thank you for that.

Any other questions or comments from my colleagues before we close? Seeing none, I will entertain a motion by Councillor Carlone to adjourn.

Councillor Carlone moved to adjourn at 11:47am

	absent	present	yea	nay
Councillor Carlone			x	
Vice Mayor Alanna Mallon			x	
Councillor McGovern			x	
Councillor Nolan	x			
Councillor Denise Simmons	x			
Councillor Sobrinho-Wheeler			x	
Councillor Tim Toomey			x	
Chair - Councillor Zondervan			x	

>>Quinton Zondervan - Chair: thanks everyone.

a communication was received from the community, regarding Carl Barron Plaza reconstruction.

a communication transmitted from louis a. depasquale, city manager, relative to awaiting report item number 21-80, regarding a report on redesign work done at Carl Barron Plaza.

a communication was received from city staff transmitting a presentation for the health and environment committee meeting on december 8, 2021.