

MINUTES OF THE CHARTER REVIEW COMMITTEE

Tuesday, November 8, 2022

The Cambridge Charter Review Committee held a meeting on Tuesday, November 8, 2022. The meeting was called to order at approximately 5:30 p.m. by the Chair of the Committee, Kathleen Born. Pursuant to Chapter 20 of the Acts of 2022 adopted by Massachusetts General Assembly and approved by the Governor, this public meeting was remote via zoom.

At the request of the Chair, the Clerk called the roll.

| NAME | YES | NO | PRESENT | ABSENT |
|-----------------------------------|-------------------------------------|--------------------------|--------------------------|-------------------------------------|
| Kaleb Abebe | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> |
| Jessica Dejesus Acevedo | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Mosammat Faria Afreen | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Kathleen Born (Chairperson) | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Nikolas Bowie | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Kevin Chen | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Max Clermont | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> |
| Jennifer Gilbert | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Kai Long | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Patrick Magee | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Mina Makarious | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Lisa Peterson (joined at 5:40pm) | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Ellen Shachter(joined at 5:40 pm) | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Susan Shell | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Jim Stockard | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| VOTE TOTALS | 13 | 0 | 0 | 2 |
| | YES | NO | PRESENT | ABSENT |

13 members recorded as present. 2 members recorded as absent.

The Chair opened the meeting with the Adoption of the Minutes of the October 25, 2022, meeting.

Chair Born recognized Member Jim Stockard who made a motion to adopt the minutes from the October 25, 2022, meeting. The motion was seconded by Member Susan Shell.

At the request of the Chair, the Clerk called the roll.

| NAME | YES | NO | PRESENT | ABSENT |
|-----------------------------|-------------------------------------|--------------------------|--------------------------|-------------------------------------|
| Kaleb Abebe | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Jessica Dejesus Acevedo | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Mosammat Faria Afreen | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> |
| Kathleen Born (Chairperson) | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Nikolas Bowie | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Kevin Chen | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Max Clermont | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Jennifer Gilbert | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Kai Long | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Patrick Magee | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Mina Makarious | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> |
| Lisa Peterson | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> |
| Ellen Shachter | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> |
| Susan Shell | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Jim Stockard | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| VOTE TOTALS | 11 | 0 | 0 | 4 |
| | YES | NO | PRESENT | ABSENT |

The motion to amend the minutes from the October 25, 2022, meeting passed with 11 in the affirmative and 4 members recorded as absent.

The Chair brought forward the following Communications to the Committee to be placed on file:

- Communications from Committee Members
 - Communication from Chair Kathy Born
- Communications from Council Members
 - Communication from Councillor Patricia Nolan
- Communications from the Public
 - Communication from Jameson Quinn
 - Communication from robin Chen

Member Max Clermont stated that they had received a communication from a member of the public via Twitter DM, Chair Born allowed Member Clermont to read the Communication into the record and asked that it also be sent via email to the Charter Committee email address.

Chair Born recognized a motion from Member Max Clermont to place the Communications on file. The motion was seconded by Member Jim Stockard.

At the request of the Chair, the Clerk called the roll.

| NAME | YES | NO | PRESENT | ABSENT |
|-----------------------------|-------------------------------------|--------------------------|--------------------------|-------------------------------------|
| Kaleb Abebe | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Jessica Dejesus Acevedo | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Mosammat Faria Afreen | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> |
| Kathleen Born (Chairperson) | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Nikolas Bowie | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Kevin Chen | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Max Clermont | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Jennifer Gilbert | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Kai Long | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Patrick Magee | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Mina Makarious | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> |
| Lisa Peterson | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Ellen Shachter | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Susan Shell | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Jim Stockard | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| VOTE TOTALS | 13 | 0 | 0 | 2 |
| | YES | NO | PRESENT | ABSENT |

The motion to place the Communications received by the Committee passed with 13 members voting in the affirmative and 2 members recorded as absent.

Chair Born introduced Elizabeth Corbo who presented the team from the Collin Center and their follow-up memo, the purpose of which is to align the themes and values discussed at the last meeting with the current Charter. Ms. Corbo identified emerging themes including enfranchising and equity, and how these tie in with the themes of participation and accessibility. Ms. Corbo stated that while some themes can't be addressed by the Charter, they were kept on the list. Ms. Corbo concluded the summary of the themes compiled in the memo with a question to the Committee of whether they would like to set a value statement where some of the emerging themes might be included. She then asked committee members for additional themes or questions.

Member Jessica Acevedo asked about stipends, specifically where does budget funding for these come from and who do stipends go to.

Member Ellen Schachter asked about incorporating technology and asked for clarification on how including this would not become obsolete quickly.

Member Susan Shell asked about deliberation beyond everyone getting a voice (good decision making) and whether the Charter has a role in changing the City's demographics (inclusive of working and middle class) and making it more people balanced.

Member Nikolas Bowie asked about how the committee will proceed, whether they will go through the charter section by section or start with key concepts and answer broader questions before narrowing down. He asked how concepts would be ordered (value statement) and what are the values that would be agreed upon. He asked what the method of decision making will be adopted by the committee. He also

asked for clarification on whether the value statement would be for the city (as in a preamble to the Charter), or values to guide decisions and operations of the committee

Chair Born asked about clarifying the process going forward and agreed that the committee might start by crafting a value statement.

Anna Corning presented a voting method called 'Fist to Five' as a method of gauging consensus among members to facilitate making decisions throughout the process, before making final votes.

Member Lisa Petersen asked if translation services should be required for the general operation of the city as a part of the theme of Enfranchising and Equity.

Member Jim Stockard stated that the committee should begin the discussion about the value statement saying that it's both important and limited and that he would look to the Collins Center to guide the committee through examples such as public financing of campaigning to increase diversity.

Elizabeth Corbo and **Michael Ward** engaged in conversation with the members, answering some of their questions and clarifying points in the memo. Ms. Corbo concluded the discussion of the memo by saying that once the committee decides how they want to proceed, the Collins Center will provide discussion memos, trend data, and research to inform discussions.

Member Susan Shell asked for clarification on what the value statement was particularly for (Committee or the preamble for the city overall). She stated that she would be uncomfortable making a value statement for the city overall.

Ms. Corbo stated that the only value statement being discussed was pertaining to the Charter Review Committee alone.

Chair Born recognized a motion from Member Nikolas Bowie to discuss a value statement for the ensuing 30 minutes, with a limit of 2 minutes per member. At the request of the Chair, the Clerk took a voice vote, all members voted in the affirmative to proceed as stated in the motion

The committee spent the next 30 minutes discussing ideas for creation of its value statement. The committee reviewed examples of value statements from other communities including Framingham and Somerville, with members suggesting ideas that they would like to have incorporated. Ms. Corbo guided the group by suggesting a 2-part solution of having a value statement and separate operating principles. Chair Born suggested that each member email values to Anna Corning and Patrick Hayes to compile and come up with an outline of values and principles for the writing committee to begin working off. Member Lisa Petersen stressed the importance of clarifying through the values the lens which the committee will define as critical in looking at the Charter. Member Nikolas Bowie made a motion to invite the Collins Center to craft a document that mirrors the City Council's division including the discussion of this and previous meetings. Anna Corning suggested that the committee members take this up, so that it is coming from the committee, with members Mina Markarious and Jessica Acevedo volunteering to work with the Collins Center to prepare such a document. Elliot Veloso (Cambridge Law Dept.) reminded the committee that there are minutes and notes to facilitate production of a committee-driven document. Member Patrick Magee suggested a friendly amendment to Member Bowie's motion that the volunteer members join with the Collins Center in a call to inform the work of the Collins Center on this document.

Chair Born recognized the motion from Nikolas Bowie that the Collins Center work with members of the Committee to draft a value statement. The motion was seconded by member Patrick Magee.

At the request of the Chair, the Clerk called the roll.

| NAME | YES | NO | PRESENT | ABSENT |
|-----------------------------|-------------------------------------|--------------------------|--------------------------|-------------------------------------|
| Kaleb Abebe | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Jessica Dejesus Acevedo | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Mosammat Faria Afreen | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> |
| Kathleen Born (Chairperson) | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Nikolas Bowie | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Kevin Chen | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Max Clermont | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> |
| Jennifer Gilbert | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Kai Long | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Patrick Magee | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Mina Makarious | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Lisa Peterson | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Ellen Shachter | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Susan Shell | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Jim Stockard | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| VOTE TOTALS | 13 | 0 | 0 | 2 |
| | YES | NO | PRESENT | ABSENT |

The motion that the Collins Center work with members of the Committee to draft a value statement passed with 13 members voting in the affirmative and 2 members recorded as absent.

The Chair opened the floor to hear from member of the public (Public Comment)

A comment was read by Patrick Hayes that was received from Jameson Quinn

Member Nikolas Bowie made a motion to adopt the Collins Center recommendation to proceed by discussion of general topics, starting with the structure of government, rather than going line-by-line through the Charter.

Chair Born recognized Member Nikolas Bowie’s motion. The motion was seconded by Member Ellen Schachter

At the request of the Chair, the Clerk called the roll.

| NAME | YES | NO | PRESENT | ABSENT |
|-----------------------------|-------------------------------------|--------------------------|--------------------------|-------------------------------------|
| Kaleb Abebe | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> |
| Jessica Dejesus Acevedo | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Mosammat Faria Afreen | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Kathleen Born (Chairperson) | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Nikolas Bowie | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Kevin Chen | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Max Clermont | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> |
| Jennifer Gilbert | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Kai Long | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Patrick Magee | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Mina Makarious | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Lisa Peterson | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Ellen Shachter | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Susan Shell | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Jim Stockard | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| VOTE TOTALS | 13 | 0 | 0 | 2 |
| | YES | NO | PRESENT | ABSENT |

The motion to adopt the Collins Center recommendation to proceed by discussion of general topics, starting with the structure of government, rather than going line-by-line through the Charter passed with 13 members voting in the affirmative and 2 members voting absent.

The meeting was adjourned at 7:35 pm.