MINUTES OF THE CAMBRIDGE CHARTER REVIEW COMMITTEE TUESDAY, DECEMBER 19, 2023

COMMITTEE MEMBERS

Kathleen Born, Chair Kaleb Abebe Jessica DeJesus Acevedo Mosammat Faria Afreen Nikolas Bowie Kevin Chen Max Clermont Jennifer Gilbert Kai Long Patrick Magee Mina Makarious Lisa Peterson Ellen Shachter Susan Shell Jim Stockard

The Cambridge Charter Review Committee held a meeting on Tuesday, December 19, 2023. The meeting was called to order at approximately 5:30p.m. by the Chair of the Committee, Kathleen Born. Pursuant to Chapter 2 of the Acts of 2023 adopted by Massachusetts General Court and approved by the Governor, this meeting was remote via Zoom.

At the request of the Chair, Deputy City Clerk Crane called the roll.

Kaleb Abebe - Present Jessica DeJesus Acevedo – Present Mosammat Faria Afreen - Present Nikolas Bowie - Absent Kevin Chen – Absent Max Clermont – Absent Jennifer Gilbert – Absent Kai Long – Present Patrick Magee - Present Mina Makarious – Present Lisa Peterson – Present Ellen Shachter – Present Susan Shell – Present Jim Stockard - Present Kathleen Born – Present Present – 11, Absent – 4. Quorum established.

The Chair, Kathleen Born made a motion to amend the minutes from the December 5, 2023 meeting.

Deputy City Clerk Crane called the roll.

Kaleb Abebe – Yes Jessica DeJesus Acevedo - Yes Mosammat Faria Afreen – Yes Nikolas Bowie – Absent Kevin Chen – Absent Max Clermont – Absent Jennifer Gilbert – Absent Kai Long – Yes Patrick Magee – Yes Mina Makarious – Yes Lisa Peterson – Yes Ellen Shachter – Yes Susan Shell – Yes Jim Stockard – Yes Kathleen Born – Yes Yes – 11, No – 0, Absent – 4. Motion passed.

The Chair, Kathleen Born made a motion for the amendment of the minutes to read Mayor/CAFO/Council and Council/Manager form of government in place of Strong Mayor and Strong Manager on page 5 of the December 5, 2023 minutes. Deputy City Clerk Crane called the roll. Kaleb Abebe – Yes Jessica DeJesus Acevedo - Yes Mosammat Faria Afreen – Yes Nikolas Bowie – Absent Kevin Chen – Absent Max Clermont – Absent Jennifer Gilbert – Yes Kai Long - Yes Patrick Magee – Yes Mina Makarious – Yes Lisa Peterson – Yes Ellen Shachter – Yes Susan Shell – Yes Jim Stockard – Yes Kathleen Born – Yes

Yes – 12, No – 0, Absent – 3. Motion passed.

The Chair, Kathleen Born made a motion to adopt the December 5, 2023 minutes as amended.

Deputy City Clerk Crane called the roll. Kaleb Abebe – Yes Jessica DeJesus Acevedo – Yes Mosammat Faria Afreen – Yes Nikolas Bowie – Absent Kevin Chen – Absent Max Clermont – Absent Jennifer Gilbert – Yes Kai Long – Yes Patrick Magee – Yes Mina Makarious – Yes Lisa Peterson – Yes Ellen Shachter – Yes Susan Shell – Yes Jim Stockard – Yes Kathleen Born – Yes **Yes – 12, No – 0, Absent – 3. Motion passed.**

The Chair, Kathleen Born recognized member Jim Stockard who made a motion to accept communications received from the public and Committee members. Deputy City Clerk Crane called the roll. Kaleb Abebe – Yes Jessica DeJesus Acevedo – Yes Mosammat Faria Afreen – Yes Nikolas Bowie – Absent Kevin Chen – Absent Kevin Chen – Absent Jennifer Gilbert – Yes Kai Long – Yes Patrick Magee – Yes

Mina Makarious – Yes Lisa Peterson – Yes Ellen Shachter – Yes Susan Shell – Yes Jim Stockard – Yes Kathleen Born – Yes **Yes – 12, No – 0, Absent – 3. Motion passed.**

The Chair, Kathleen Born opened Public Comment.

Jameson Quinn thanked the Committee for all their hard work and offered comments on elections and voting methods.

Dan Totten offered comments regarding the School Committee and the budget.

Anna Corning, Project Manager reviewed the decision points and deliberation information document that the Committee will be discussing throughout the meeting. The document was provided in advance of the meeting and included in the Agenda Packet. Anna Corning noted that the goal was to take votes on all the matters that were presented in the decision point document to be able to include those decisions in the final report to the City Council. Anna Corning and the team from the Collins Center, Michael Ward and Patrcia Lloyd, were available to respond to any

questions or concerns that were brought forward by Committee members during discussion. Throughout the meeting, Committee members were recognized to offer their comments on each discussion point.

CITY COUNCIL COMPOSITIONS

The Chair, Kathleen Born recognized member Susan Shell who made a motion that the Committee recommend maintaining two-year terms for the City Council. Deputy City Clerk Crane called the roll.

Kaleb Abebe – Yes Jessica DeJesus Acevedo - Yes Mosammat Faria Afreen - Yes Nikolas Bowie – Yes Kevin Chen - Absent Max Clermont – Absent Jennifer Gilbert – Yes Kai Long – No Patrick Magee - Yes Mina Makarious – Yes Lisa Peterson – Yes Ellen Shachter – Yes Susan Shell - Yes Jim Stockard – Yes Kathleen Born – Yes Yes -12, No -1, Absent -2. Motion passed.

The Chair, Kathleen Born recognized member Jim Stockard who made a motion for the Committee to recommend Cambridge maintain an at-large City Council of nine members. Deputy City Clerk Crane called the roll.

Kaleb Abebe – Yes Jessica DeJesus Acevedo - Yes Mosammat Faria Afreen - Present Nikolas Bowie – Yes Kevin Chen – Absent Max Clermont – Absent Jennifer Gilbert – Yes Kai Long – Yes Patrick Magee – Yes Mina Makarious – Yes Lisa Peterson – Yes Ellen Shachter – Yes Susan Shell – No Jim Stockard – Yes Kathleen Born – Yes Yes – 11, No – 1, Present – 1, Absent – 2. Motion passed.

MAYOR AND COUNCIL PRESIDENT'S ROLE ON SCHOOL COMMITTEE

The Chair, Kathleen Born recognized member Mosammat Faria Afreen who made a motion for the Committee to recommend the Mayor serve on the School Committee. Deputy City Clerk Crane called the roll under the Mayor/CAFO/Council form of government.

Kaleb Abebe - Present Jessica DeJesus Acevedo - Yes Mosammat Faria Afreen – Yes Nikolas Bowie – Present Kevin Chen – Absent Max Clermont – Absent Jennifer Gilbert – Yes Kai Long – Yes Patrick Magee - Present Mina Makarious – Yes Lisa Peterson – Yes Ellen Shachter – Yes Susan Shell – Present Jim Stockard - No Kathleen Born – Yes Yes – 8, No – 1, Present – 4, Absent – 2. Motion failed.

The Chair, Kathleen Born recognized member Kaleb Abebe who made a motion that the Committee recommend the Mayor is automatically the Chair of the School Committee under the Mayor/CAFO/Council form of government. Deputy City Clerk Crane called the roll. Kaleb Abebe – Present Jessica DeJesus Acevedo – No Mosammat Faria Afreen – No Nikolas Bowie – Present Kevin Chen – Absent Max Clermont – Absent Jennifer Gilbert – Present Kai Long – Bi Patrick Magee - Present Mina Makarious – No Lisa Peterson – No Ellen Shachter – No Susan Shell – No Jim Stockard – No Kathleen Born – No Yes – 0, No – 9, Present – 4, Absent – 2. Motion failed.

The Chair, Kathleen Born recognized member Susan Shell who made a motion that the Committee recommend the City Council President serve on the School Committee under the Mayor/CAFO/Council form of government. Deputy City Clerk Crane called the roll. Kaleb Abebe - Present Jessica DeJesus Acevedo - Yes Mosammat Faria Afreen - Present Nikolas Bowie - Present Kevin Chen – Absent Max Clermont – Absent Jennifer Gilbert - Present Kai Long - Yes Patrick Magee - Present Mina Makarious – No Lisa Peterson – Present Ellen Shachter – Present Susan Shell – Present Jim Stockard – Yes Kathleen Born – Yes Yes – 4, No – 1, Present – 8, Absent – 2. Motion failed.

The Chair, Kathleen Born recognized member Lisa Peterson who made a motion that the Committee recommend the Mayor serve on the School Committee under the Council/Manager form of government. Deputy City Clerk Crane called the roll. Kaleb Abebe – Present Jessica DeJesus Acevedo - Yes Mosammat Faria Afreen – Yes Nikolas Bowie – Present Kevin Chen – Absent Max Clermont – Absent Jennifer Gilbert - Yes Kai Long – Yes Patrick Magee – Yes Mina Makarious – No Lisa Peterson – Yes Ellen Shachter – Yes Susan Shell – Present Jim Stockard – Yes Kathleen Born – Yes Yes – 9, No – 1, Present – 3, Absent – 2. Motion passed.

The Chair, Kathleen Born recognized member Mosammat Faria Afreen who made a motion that the Committee recommend the Mayor is automatically the Chair of the School Committee under the Manager/Council form of government. Deputy City Clerk Crane called the roll. Kaleb Abebe – Present Jessica DeJesus Acevedo - No Mosammat Faria Afreen – No Nikolos Bowie - No Kevin Chen – Absent Max Clermont – Absent Jennifer Gilbert – Present Kai Long – No Patrick Magee – No Mina Makarious – No Lisa Peterson – No Ellen Shachter – No Susan Shell – No Jim Stockard - No Kathleen Born – No Yes – 0, No – 11, Present – 2, Absent – 2. Motion failed.

Yes – 13, No – 0, Present – 0, Absent – 2. Motion passed.

FINANCE ARTICLE

The Chair, Kathleen Born recognized member Kaleb Abebe who made a motion for the Committee to approve recommending the draft finance article text and reflected timeline for Mayor-CAFO-Council form of government. Deputy City Clerk Crane called the roll. Kaleb Abebe – Yes Jessica DeJesus Acevedo - Yes Mosammat Faria Afreen - Yes Nikolas Bowie – Yes Kevin Chen – Absent Max Clermont – Absent Jennifer Gilbert – Yes Kai Long – Yes Patrick Magee – Yes Mina Makarious – Yes Lisa Peterson – Yes Ellen Shachter – Yes Susan Shell – Yes Jim Stockard – Yes Kathleen Born – Yes

The Chair, Kathleen Born recognized member Mina Makarious who made a motion for the Committee to approve recommending the draft finance article text and reflected timeline for Council-Manager form of government. Deputy City Clerk Crane called the roll. Kaleb Abebe – Yes Jessica DeJesus Acevedo – Present Mosammat Faria Afreen – Yes Nikolas Bowie – Yes Kevin Chen – Absent Max Clermont – Absent Jennifer Gilbert – Yes Kai Long – Yes Patrick Magee – Yes Mina Makarious – Yes Lisa Peterson – Yes Ellen Shachter – Yes Susan Shell – Yes Jim Stockard – Yes Kathleen Born – Yes **Yes – 12, No – 0, Present – 1, Absent – 2. Motion passed.**

The Chair, Kathleen Born recognized member Kaleb Abebe who made a motion that the Committee recommend that the City Council be allowed to amend the city budget (adding funds or line items but not increasing the overall budget) prior to approval, with consultation with city manager, under Council-Manager form of government. Deputy City Clerk Crane called the roll.

Kaleb Abebe – Yes Jessica DeJesus Acevedo - Yes Mosammat Faria Afreen – Yes Nikolas Bowie – Yes Kevin Chen – Absent Max Clermont – Absent Jennifer Gilbert – Yes Kai Long - Yes Patrick Magee – Present Mina Makarious – Yes Lisa Peterson – Yes Ellen Shachter – Present Susan Shell – Yes Jim Stockard – Yes Kathleen Born – Yes Yes – 11, No – 0, Present – 2, Absent – 2. Motion passed.

The Chair, Kathleen Born recognized member Mosammat Faria Afreen who made a motion that the Committee recommend that the City Council be allowed to amend the City budget (adding funds or line items, but not increasing the overall budget) prior to approval and be allowed to override the Mayor's budgetary amendments or veto under the Manger-Council form of government.

Deputy City Clerk Crane called the roll. Kaleb Abebe – Yes Jessica DeJesus Acevedo – Yes Mosammat Faria Afreen – Yes Nikolas Bowie – Yes Kevin Chen – Absent Max Clermont – Absent Jennifer Gilbert – Yes Kai Long – Yes Patrick Magee – Present Mina Makarious – Yes Lisa Peterson – Yes Ellen Shachter – Present Susan Shell – Yes Jim Stockard – No Kathleen Born – Yes **Yes – 10, No – 1, Present – 2, Absent – 2. Motion passed.**

FELONY CONVICTION

The Chair, Kathleen Born recognized member Mosammat Faria Afreen who made a motion that the Committee recommend adding the provision, "An elected official who has been convicted of a state or federal felony while holding office shall be deemed to have vacated the office." Deputy City Clerk Crane called the roll. Kaleb Abebe - Yes Jessica DeJesus Acevedo - Yes Mosammat Faria Afreen - Yes Nikolas Bowie – No Kevin Chen – Absent Max Clermont – Absent Jennifer Gilbert - Present Kai Long – Yes Patrick Magee - Yes Mina Makarious - No Lisa Peterson – Yes Ellen Shachter – Yes Susan Shell – No Jim Stockard - No Kathleen Born – No

Yes – 7, No – 5, Present – 1, Absent – 2. Motion failed.

RESIDENT ASSEMBLY

The Chair, Kathleen Born recognized member Mosammat Faria Afreen who made that the Committee take on a new item of business that the Committee recommend that if a resident assembly reaches a 2/3 supermajority the question be put to the voters. Deputy City Clerk Crane called the roll. Kaleb Abebe – Present Jessica DeJesus Acevedo – Present Mosammat Faria Afreen – Yes Nikolas Bowie – No Kevin Chen – Absent Max Clermont – Absent Jennifer Gilbert – No Kai Long – Yes Patrick Magee – Present Mina Makarious – Present Lisa Peterson – No Ellen Shachter – Present Susan Shell – Present Jim Stockard – Present Kathleen Born – Present **Yes – 2, No – 3, Present – 8, Absent – 2. Motion failed.**

The Chair, Kathleen Born recognized member Kaleb Abebe who made a motion to take a revote on a previous motion to adopt Section 2.11.2.a.iii of the proposed draft language of Resident Assembly to read: Powers that would otherwise be exercised under state or municipal law by a City Board or Commission, including the Planning Board. Deputy City Clerk Crane called the roll.

Kaleb Abebe – No Jessica DeJesus Acevedo - Present Mosammat Faria Afreen – Yes Nikolas Bowie - Yes Kevin Chen – Absent Max Clermont – Absent Jennifer Gilbert – No Kai Long – Present Patrick Magee – No Mina Makarious – No Lisa Peterson – No Ellen Shachter – No Susan Shell – No Jim Stockard - No Kathleen Born – No Yes – 2, No – 9, Present – 2, Absent – 2. Motion failed.

The Chair, Kathleen Born recognized member Jim Stockard who made a motion that the Committee wish to make a recommendation for who under the Mayor-CAFO-Council form of government who convene a Resident Assembly. Deputy City Clerk Crane called the roll. Kaleb Abebe – Yes Jessica DeJesus Acevedo – Yes Mosammat Faria Afreen – Yes Nikolas Bowie – Yes Kevin Chen – Absent Max Clermont – Absent Jennifer Gilbert – Yes Kai Long – Yes Patrick Magee – No Mina Makarious – Yes Lisa Peterson – Yes Ellen Shachter – Yes Susan Shell – No Jim Stockard – Yes Kathleen Born – Yes **Yes – 11, No – 1, Present – 1, Absent – 2.**

The Chair, Kathleen Born recognized member Mosammat Faria Afreen who made a motion that the Committee recommend that under a Mayor-CAFO-Council form of government that the City Council shall convene the Resident Assembly. Deputy City Clerk Crane called the roll. Kaleb Abebe – Yes Jessica DeJesus Acevedo - Yes Mosammat Faria Afreen – Yes Nikolas Bowie - Yes Kevin Chen – Absent Max Clermont – Absent Jennifer Gilbert – Yes Kai Long – Yes Patrick Magee - Present Mina Makarious – Yes Lisa Peterson – Yes Ellen Shachter – Yes Susan Shell – Yes Jim Stockard – Yes Kathleen Born – Yes Yes – 12, No – 0, Present – 1, Absent – 2. Motion passed.

MAYORAL RECALL

The Chair, Kathleen Born recognized member Jim Stockard who made a motion that the Committee recommends a recall provision for the Mayor under Mayor-CAFO-Council form of government, the thresholds shall be difficult but not impossible to recall a Mayor. The City Council shall collaborate with the Election Commission to determine the thresholds. Deputy City Clerk Crane called the roll.

Kaleb Abebe – Yes Jessica DeJesus Acevedo – Yes Mosammat Faria Afreen – Yes Nikolas Bowie – Yes Kevin Chen – Absent Max Clermont – Absent Jennifer Gilbert – Yes Kai Long – Yes Patrick Magee – Yes Mina Makarious – Yes Lisa Peterson – Yes Ellen Shachter – Yes Susan Shell – Yes Jim Stockard – Yes Kathleen Born – Yes **Yes – 13, No – 0, Present – 0, Absent – 2. Motion passed.**

PUBLIC ENGAGEMENT AND PARTICIPATION PROVISION

The Chair, Kathleen Born recognized member Kaleb Abebe who made a motion that the Committee recommend adding the following provision to the Public Engagement Article, "The City shall provide for a system, in addition to minutes and recordings, that maintains and records public comment, of City Council meetings, that is publicly available." Deputy City Clerk Crane called the roll.

Kaleb Abebe – Yes Jessica DeJesus Acevedo - Yes Mosammat Faria Afreen - Yes Nikolas Bowie – No Kevin Chen – Absent Max Clermont – Absent Jennifer Gilbert - No Kai Long – No Patrick Magee – No Mina Makarious – No Lisa Peterson – No Ellen Shachter – No Susan Shell – Absent Jim Stockard - No Kathleen Born – No Yes – 3, No – 9, Present – 0, Absent – 3. Motion failed.

GROUP PETITION

The Chair, Kathleen Born recognized member Patrick Magee who made a motion that the Committee recommends adding a group petition provision to the Charter, the thresholds shall be relatively low. The City Council shall collaborate with the Election Commission to determine the thresholds. Deputy City Clerk Crane called the roll. Kaleb Abebe – Yes Jessica DeJesus Acevedo – Yes Mosammat Faria Afreen – Yes Nikolas Bowie – Yes Kevin Chen – Absent Max Clermont – Absent Jennifer Gilbert – Absent Kai Long – Yes Patrick Magee – Yes Mina Makarious – Yes Lisa Peterson – Yes Ellen Shachter – Yes Susan Shell – Absent Jim Stockard – Yes Kathleen Born – Yes **Yes – 11, No – 0, Present – 0, Absent – 4. Motion passed.**

CITIZEN INITIATIVE PROVISION

The Chair, Kathleen Born recognized member Mosammat Faria Afreen who made a motion that the Committee recommends a Citizen Initiative Provision under both forms of government. The City Council shall collaborate with the Election Commission to determine the thresholds. Deputy City Clerk Crane called the roll.

Kaleb Abebe – Yes Jessica DeJesus Acevedo – Yes Mosammat Faria Afreen – Yes Nikolas Bowie – Yes Kevin Chen – Absent Max Clermont – Absent Jennifer Gilbert – Absent Kai Long – Yes Patrick Magee - Yes Mina Makarious – Yes Lisa Peterson – Yes Ellen Shachter – Yes Susan Shell – Absent Jim Stockard – Yes Kathleen Born – Yes Yes – 11, No – 0, Present – 0, Absent – 4. Motion passed.

Anna Corning thanked the Committee for their time and reviewed what the next steps are moving forward.

The Charter Review Committee adjourned at approximately 8:45p.m.

Clerk's Note: The City of Cambridge/22 City View records every City Council meeting and every City Council Committee meeting. This is a permanent record. The video for this meeting can be viewed at:

https://cambridgema.granicus.com/player/clip/641?view_id=1&redirect=true&h=29f86a4fe11b3 b2f310dee34ae9673a8